

Planning

Growth & Development

Delegated officer report for planning application

Application no. 136341/LE/2023

Date registered valid: 24 February 2023

Proposal: Use of the property as a small House in Multiple Occupation (Class C4)

Address: 110 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HS

Ward(s): Rusholme Ward

Applicant: Mr Howard Ratcliffe

Agent (if any):

Case officer: Robert Tyrer
Tel: 0161 234 4068
Email: robert.tyrer@manchester.gov.uk

Recommendation: REFUSE

Date of recommendation: 17 April 2023

Application details

Type of application: Certificate Lawful Development Existing

Development type: Certificates of lawfulness

Date of site visit: Not Required

Standard consultations:

No consultations have been printed and sent.

Neighbour notifications

Printed: 8 March 2023 Expired: 29 March 2023

Site notice

No site notice has been produced

Press advert

No press advert had been published

Departure from Development Plan: No

Environmental Statement: Not required

Description of site/building

The application site relates to a two storey large semi-detached property located on the corner of Dickenson Road and Hal Road.

Listed building: Not applicable

Conservation area: Not applicable

Tree Preservation Order: Not applicable

Description of area

The is residential in nature comprising of a mixture of housing arranged in either a grid like network of streets close to University Halls of residence and Rusholme District Centre or housing areas ringed and isolated by minor roads.

Description of development

The applicant is seeking CLEUD for the use of the property as a small House in Multiple Occupation (Class C4)

Consultations & Notification Responses

Publicity – Notification letters were sent to nearby residential properties (see appendix 1 for the list of properties).

No representations have been received.

Issues

Sections 191 and 192 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 provide for anyone (not just a person with a legal interest in the land) to apply to the local planning authority (LPA) for a lawful development certificate (LDC). A certificate is a statutory document certifying:

(1) in the case of an application under section 191, the lawfulness, for planning purposes, of existing operations on, or use of land, or some activity being carried out in breach of a planning condition; or

(2) in the case of an application under section 192, the lawfulness of proposed operations on, or use of land.

The onus of proof in regard to (1) is firmly on the applicant and the issue of a certificate will depend on the on factual evidence provided about the history and planning status of the building or other land and the interpretation of any relevant planning law or judicial authority. The relevant test of the evidence in this matter is “the balance of probability” and the applicants own evidence does not need to be corroborated by independent evidence. If the LPA have no evidence to contradict the applicants version of events or make them less then probable, there is no good reason to refuse the issue of a certificate.

In regard to (2), this provides that, if the LPA are supplied with information satisfying them that the use or operations described in the application would be lawful, if instituted or begun at the time of the application, they shall issue a certificate to that effect; and, in any other case, they shall refuse the application.

In short, the purpose section 192 is to enable any person who wishes to find out whether any proposed use or operations would be lawful to apply to the LPA for that purpose

The application needs to describe the proposal with sufficient clarity and precision to enable the LPA to understand (from a written description and plans) exactly what is involved in the proposal; and to submit whatever supporting information or legal submission that are to be relied upon in order to satisfy the LPA that a certificate should be granted for the proposal.

In making their decision on an application under section 192, the LPA ask themselves the hypothetical question - "If this proposed change of use had already occurred, or if this proposed operation had commenced, on the application date, would it have been lawful for planning purposes?" In doing so, the LPA will not only consider whether the proposal would involve "development" requiring an application for planning permission, but whether it would involve a breach of any existing condition or limitation imposed on a grant of planning permission which has been acted upon, and which therefore constrains what can be done on the land. The LPA will not make a proposal fit a scenario; the only question is whether the proposal made by the applicant is lawful at the time of submission.

The Application

This application is pursued under subsection (1) of section 191 which provides for an application to determine whether a specified existing use, operation, or failure to comply with a planning condition or limitation, which has already been carried out on land is lawful for planning purposes

Evidence – The following evidence has been submitted for consideration:

1. A site location plan edged in red.
2. HMO Property Licence granted on the 31st October 2021

In a case of this type, the onus is on the applicant to substantiate their case, on the balance of probability. The applicant needs to demonstrate that the use as a small house in multiple occupation (Class C4) commenced more than ten years prior to the date of the application (i.e. by 23rd February 2013) and continued without a significant break for ten years.

Class C4 is defined in the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987, as amended, as "Use of a dwellinghouse by not more than six residents as a "house in multiple occupation". This latter term is as defined in S.254 of the Housing Act 2004.

The application site relates to a semi-detached, two storey house, with a small rear yard and front garden on the corner of Dickenson Road and Hall Road. The application form states that the property has been let as HMO before and continually since the Article 4 Direction came into place in October 2011 with a given start date of 31st October 1997.

The applicant has provided a copy of the most recent HMO Licence for the property granted on the 31st October 2021. The licence states that the council is satisfied that the licensed premises are reasonably suitable for occupation by not more than 6 occupants and/or 6 households.

The Planning Practice Guidance points to the need for evidence to be sufficiently precise and unambiguous to justify the grant of a certificate on the balance of probability.

The application has failed to provide sufficient evidence to demonstrate that the C4 Use commenced more than ten years prior to the date of the application (i.e. by 23rd February 2013) and continued without a significant break for ten years and it is therefore recommended that the certificate is refused.

Other Legislative Requirements

Equality Act 2010

Section 149 (Public Sector Equality Duty) of the Equality Act 2010 requires due regard to the need to: Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Act and; Advance equality of opportunity between persons who share a protected characteristic and persons who do not share it. The Equality Duty does not impose a legal requirement to conduct an Equality Impact Assessment. Compliance with the Equality Duty involves consciously thinking about the aims of the Equality Duty as part of the process of decision-making.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations

This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have a right to a fair hearing and to this end the local planning authority must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Core Strategy and saved policies of the Unitary Development Plan, the Director of Planning, Building Control & Licensing has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. She believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the recommendation given is proportionate to the wider benefits of and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Recommendation: REFUSE

Condition(s) to be attached to decision for approval OR Reasons for recommendation to refuse

1) The applicant has failed to demonstrate that number 110 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HS has been occupied as a small scale house in multiple occupation Class C4 of the schedule to the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987 (as amended) for a continual 10 year period up to the date of the application.

Appendix 1 – List of consultees & neighbours notified

65 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 3, 67 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 4, 67 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 2, 67 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 1, 67 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
61 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 6, 63 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 5, 63 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 3, 63 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 1, 63 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
63 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
6 Hall Road, Manchester, M14 5HL
4 Hall Road, Manchester, M14 5HL
1 Hall Road, Manchester, M14 5HN
108 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HJ
Ground Floor, 69 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Ground Floor F I Team West, 69 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Longsight Family Unit Ground Floor And 1, 69 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Ground Floor Manchester Social Services And First Floor, 69 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Ground Floor And First Floor, 69 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 4, 106 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HJ
Flat 3, 106 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HJ
Flat 2, 106 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HJ
Flat 1, 106 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HJ
69 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5AZ
Flat 1, 112 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HS
Flat 2, 114 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HS
Flat 2, 112 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HS
Flat 1, 114 Dickenson Road, Manchester, M14 5HS
2 Hall Road, Manchester, M14 5HL
2A Hall Road, Manchester, M14 5HL

Appendix 2 – Planning constraints

Article 4 Direction - Removal Of PD Rights Change Of Use From Class C3 To Class C4
Aircraft Safeguarding Zone - Aircraft Safeguarding Zone - All Exceeding 90M
Coal Authority - Development Low Risk - Name: DEVELOPMENT_LOW_RISK_AREA
Area Team Boundary - Name: SOUTH AREA