

Planning

Growth & Development

Delegated officer report for planning application

Application no. 136467/LO/2023 and 136466/FO/2023

Date registered valid: 17 March 2023

Proposal: Listed Building Consent for the replacement of structural glazing and repairs to masonry, timber and metalwork.

Address: 1830 Warehouse, Museum Of Science And Industry, Liverpool Road, Manchester, M3 4FP

Ward(s): Deansgate Ward

Applicant: Science and Industry Museum

Agent (if any): Joe McElhone Deloitte LLP

Case officer: Jack Naven
Tel: 0161 219 2095
Email: jack.naven@manchester.gov.uk

Recommendation: Approved

Date of recommendation: 18/07/2023

Application Details

Type of application: Listed Building Consent

Development type: Listed building alteration

Date of site visit: 18 April 2023

Standard consultations:

Printed: 30 March 2023 Expired: 20 April 2023

Neighbour notifications

No neighbour notifications have been printed and sent.

Site notice

Posted: Expired:

Press advert

Published: 4 April 2023 Expired: 25 April 2023

Departure from Development Plan: No

Environmental Statement: Not required

Description of Site/Area

Listed building: Grade II

Conservation area: Castlefield Conservation Area 1979

Tree Preservation Order: Not applicable

The Science and Industry Museum (formerly known as the Museum of Science and Industry) is a large museum devoted to the development of science, technology and industry with emphasis on the city's achievements in these fields. The museum is part of the Science Museum Group, a non-departmental public body of the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, having merged with the National Science Museum in 2012.

The site is located within the Castlefield Conservation Area. The large and complex former "Liverpool Road Railway Station" site contains a significant collection of Grade I and Grade II listed buildings.

The proposal site relates to a The Lower and Upper yards of the 1830s Warehouse which are open setted spaces which connect the historic buildings of the Science and Industry Museum, Manchester.

Description of Development

The application seeks Listed Building Consent for alterations to the Grade I Listed 1830 Warehouse for the replacement of structural glazing and repairs to masonry, timber and metalwork.

Consultations & Notification Responses

Urban Design & Heritage - Various issues were raised by Urban Design & Heritage relating to the proposals. These issues have been resolved to their satisfaction. Numerous conditions were suggested to be attached to the application.

Historic England - Did not provide any advice.

Policy

The main issue for consideration relates to the impact of the proposals on the identified heritage assets in regard to preserving and, where possible, enhancing identified assets. The main policies that relate to the proposal are Section 16 (Conserving and enhancing the Historic Environment) of the revised National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (2019), and Policies DM1 (Development Management), EN3 (Heritage), EN1 (Design Principles and Strategic Character Areas), CC9 (Design and Heritage) and SP1 (Spatial Principles) of the Adopted Core Strategy for the City of Manchester (2012), and saved policies DC18.1 (Conservation Areas) and DC19.1 (Listed Buildings) of the Unitary Development Plan for Manchester (1995).

The Adopted Core Strategy for the City of Manchester

CC9 (Design and Heritage) states that development in Manchester City Centre should preserve or enhance the heritage assets that have been identified. Developers must recognise the specific design challenges that must be overcome to ensure complementary of function and form.

EN3 (Heritage) states that the Council will encourage development that complements and takes advantage of the distinct historic and heritage features of its districts and neighbourhoods. New developments must be designed so as to support the Council in preserving, or where possible, enhancing the historic environment, the character, setting and accessibility of areas and buildings of acknowledged importance.

SP1 (Spatial Principles) states that development in all parts of the city should protect and enhance the built and natural environment.

DM 1 (Development Management) states that development should have regard to appropriate siting, layout, scale, form, massing, materials and detail; impact on surrounding areas in terms of the design, scale and appearance of the proposed development; development should have regard to the character of the surrounding area; and effects on amenity.

EN4 (Reducing CO2 Emissions by Enabling Low and Zero Carbon Development) states that the Council will seek to reduce fuel poverty and decouple growth in the economy, growth in CO2 emissions, and rising fossil fuel prices through a number of actions.

The Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester

DC18.1 (Conservation Areas) states that the Council will give particularly careful consideration to development proposals within Conservation Area. The Council will seek to preserve and enhance the character of its designated conservation areas by carefully considering; the relationship of new structures to neighbouring buildings and spaces; and the effect of major changes to the appearance of existing buildings.

DC19.1 (Listed Buildings) states that the Council will have regard to the desirability of securing the retention, restoration, maintenance and continued use of such buildings and to

protecting their general settings by; not permitting any external or internal alterations or addition to a listed building where, in its opinion, there would be an adverse effect on its architectural or historic character; and seek to preserve and enhance the setting of listed buildings by appropriate control over the design of new development in their vicinity, control over the use of adjacent land, and where appropriate, by the preservation of trees and landscape features.

National Policy

The revised **NPPF (2019) Section 16 (Conserving and enhancing the Historic Environment) paragraph 193** highlights that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

Paragraph 196 of the revised NPPF (2019) highlights that where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal.

Other Legislation

Section 16 (2) of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (the "Listed Building Act") provides that "in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works to a listed building, the local planning authority or the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses"

Section 66 Listed Building Act requires the local planning authority to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the setting of listed buildings. This requires more than a simple balancing exercise and considerable importance and weight should be given to the desirability of preserving the setting. Members should consider whether there is justification for overriding the presumption in favour of preservation.

Section 72 of the Listed Building Act provides that in the exercise of the power to determine planning applications for land or buildings within a conservation area, special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.

Issues

Proposal and Assessment of Significance

There is no objection to the principle of the replacement of structural glazing and repairs to masonry, timber and metalwork. The supporting heritage assessment, undertaken by HCUK Group, comprehensively sets out the significance of the buildings within the site and other designated heritage assets.

Impact on Heritage Asset

There will be some impact on the heritage asset caused by the replacement of structural glazing. A frameless/capless system was the preferred option in terms of reducing any harm to the heritage asset. Although it was hoped that this could be achieved by using the existing channels already in place, instead of creating new channels, it has been confirmed by the applicant that the frameless/capless system is not technically possible to install using the existing channels. Overall, the framed/capped system that was proposed by the client was

determined to cause less overall harm to the heritage asset, as it would be able to utilise the existing channels for the existing window system instead of creating new channels.

The repairs to the masonry, timber, and the metalwork and not considered to cause substantial harm to the heritage asset. These works are considered necessary as part of the upkeep of the 1830 Warehouse and in all cases, the work will be carried out to a standard that will cause as little harm as possible to the heritage asset and will either match like for like or be in keeping with what is already in place.

Appropriate conditions regarding final details and dimensions of the frame, method statement, brickwork samples, scaffolding designs, and item of repairs, will be attached to ensure that the works are in accordance with the legislation, guidance and policies previously highlighted within this report to make sure a minimum amount of harm is caused to the historic fabric of this building due to these works being undertaken.

Conclusion

The works are necessary, appropriate, proportionate and well considered. The proposal in principle seems acceptable and whilst there is a low level of harm, there are heritage benefits in terms of building repairs and futureproofing the building as well as making alterations to ensure its long-term preservation. Overall, the works will represent an enhancement.

Other Legislative Requirements

Equality Act 2010

Section 149 (Public Sector Equality Duty) of the Equality Act 2010 requires due regard to the need to: Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Act and; Advance equality of opportunity between persons who share a protected characteristic and persons who do not share it. The Equality Duty does not impose a legal requirement to conduct an Equality Impact Assessment. Compliance with the Equality Duty involves consciously thinking about the aims of the Equality Duty as part of the process of decision-making.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations

This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have a right to a fair hearing and to this end the local planning authority must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Core Strategy and saved policies of the Unitary Development Plan, the Director of Planning, Building Control & Licensing has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. She believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the recommendation given is proportionate to the wider benefits of and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Recommendation: Approved

Article 35 Declaration

Officers have worked with the applicant / agent in a positive and proactive manner to guide the application through all stages of the planning process and resolve any issues that arose in dealing with the planning application. Further information was sought from officers during the application and amendments were made to the proposal. Appropriate conditions were attached to the decision to ensure an acceptable development with the agreement of the applicant.

Condition(s) to be attached to decision for approval OR Reasons for recommendation to refuse for 136467/LO/2023

1) The development must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this permission.

Reason - Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following drawings:

Received by the City Council, as Local Planning Authority, on the 13 March 2023:

Location Plan 275/PD/001

Site Plan 275/PD/002

Wagon Arch Glazing: Proposed external & internal elevations 275/PD/201

Wagon Arch Glazing: Proposed Works to Bay 01 275/PD/210

Wagon Arch Glazing: Proposed Works to Bay 02 275/PD/211

Wagon Arch Glazing: Proposed Works to Bay 03 275/PD/212

Cargo Door Sills: Proposed Works 275/PD/340

Proposed Works to Existing Building: Basement 275/PD/710

Proposed Works to Existing Building: Ground Floor & Ground Mezzanine 275/PD/711

Proposed Works to Existing Building: First Floor 275/PD/712

Proposed Works to Existing Building: Second Floor & Second Floor Mezzanine 275/PD/713

Proposed Works to Existing Building: External Elevation 275/PD/720

Proposed Works to Existing Building: Internal Elevation GA 275/PD/750

Basement Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-1099

Ground Floor Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-GF-DR-S-1100

Ground Floor Mezzanine Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-M0-DR-S-1101

First Floor Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-01-DR-S-1102

South Elevation Bays 1 and 2 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3100

South Elevation Bays 3 and 4 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3101

South Elevation Bay 5 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3102

East Elevation Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3103

North Elevation Bays 4 and 5 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3104

North Elevation Bays 2 and 3 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3105

North Elevation Bay 1 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3106

West Elevation Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3107

Basement Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-1099

Ground Floor Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-GF-DR-S-1100

Ground Floor Mezzanine Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-M0-DR-S-1101

First Floor Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-01-DR-S-1102

South Elevation Bays 1 and 2 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3100

South Elevation Bays 3 and 4 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3101
South Elevation Bay 5 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3102
East Elevation Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3103
North Elevation Bays 4 and 5 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3104
North Elevation Bay 2 and 3 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3105
North Elevation Bay 1 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3106
West Elevation Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3107
Typical Structural Repairs Detail Sheet 1 220627-CON-XX-ZZ-DR-S-4001
Typical Structural Repairs Detail Sheet 2 220627-CON-XX-ZZ-DR-S-4002
Typical Structural Repairs Detail Sheet 3 220627-CON-XX-ZZ-DR-S-4003
Stone Repair Details 220627-CON-XX-ZZ-DR-S-4004
Constuction Method Statement
Design and Access Statement
Heritage Statement

Received by the City Council, as Local Planning Authority, on the 11 May 2023:
Proposed Bay 1 275 / PD / 210A
Proposed Bay 2 275 / PD / 211A
Proposed Bay 3 275 / PD / 212A

Received by the City Council, as Local Planning Authority, on the 26 June 2023:
Design Note

Reason - To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans pursuant to Core Strategy policies SP1, DM1, and EN3 and saved Unitary Development Plan policy DC19.

3) Notwithstanding the details as set out in condition 2 above, prior to the work being carried out, the final details and dimensions of the frame shall be submitted and approved by the City Council as Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building and to ensure consistency in accordance with policy and EN3 of the Core Strategy and saved policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

4) Notwithstanding the details as set out in condition 2 above, prior to the work being carried out, a detailed contractors method statement developed for the careful removal of stone steps and their reinstatement shall be submitted and approved by the City Council as Local Planning Authority.

For the avoidance of doubt, this method statement must including the following:

- Recording of any defects prior to work being carried out and photos
- What protection will be put in place?
- Method of lifting
- Equipment being used
- Method of marking
- Storage and stacking

The development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building and to ensure consistency in accordance with policy and EN3 of the Core Strategy and saved policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

5) Notwithstanding the details as set out in condition 2 above, prior to the work being carried out, a sample of the brickwork being proposed for repairs shall be submitted and approved by the City Council as Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building and to ensure consistency in accordance with policy and EN3 of the Core Strategy and saved policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

6) Notwithstanding the details as set out in condition 2 above, prior to the work being carried out, the design for the scaffolding required to undertake these works shall be submitted and approved by the City Council as Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building and to ensure consistency in accordance with policy and EN3 of the Core Strategy and saved policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

7) Notwithstanding the details as set out in condition 2 above, prior to the work being carried out, physical samples on site of each item of repair, including masonry and timber repairs, shall be approved by the City Council as Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building and to ensure consistency in accordance with policy and EN3 of the Core Strategy and saved policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

Condition(s) to be attached to decision for approval OR Reasons for recommendation to refuse for 136466/FO/2023

1) The development must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this permission.

Reason - Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following drawings:

Received by the City Council, as Local Planning Authority, on the 13 March 2023:

Location Plan 275/PD/001
Site Plan 275/PD/002
Wagon Arch Glazing: Proposed external & internal elevations 275/PD/201
Wagon Arch Glazing: Proposed Works to Bay 01 275/PD/210
Wagon Arch Glazing: Proposed Works to Bay 02 275/PD/211
Wagon Arch Glazing: Proposed Works to Bay 03 275/PD/212
Cargo Door Sills: Proposed Works 275/PD/340
Proposed Works to Existing Building: Basement 275/PD/710
Proposed Works to Existing Building: Ground Floor & Ground Mezzanine 275/PD/711
Proposed Works to Existing Building: First Floor 275/PD/712
Proposed Works to Existing Building: Second Floor & Second Floor Mezzanine 275/PD/713
Proposed Works to Existing Building: External Elevation 275/PD/720
Proposed Works to Existing Building: Internal Elevation GA 275/PD/750
Basement Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-1099
Ground Floor Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-GF-DR-S-1100
Ground Floor Mezzanine Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-M0-DR-S-1101
First Floor Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-01-DR-S-1102
South Elevation Bays 1 and 2 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3100
South Elevation Bays 3 and 4 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3101
South Elevation Bay 5 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3102
East Elevation Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3103
North Elevation Bays 4 and 5 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3104
North Elevation Bays 2 and 3 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3105
North Elevation Bay 1 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3106
West Elevation Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3107
Basement Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-1099
Ground Floor Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-GF-DR-S-1100
Ground Floor Mezzanine Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-M0-DR-S-1101
First Floor Plan Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-01-DR-S-1102
South Elevation Bays 1 and 2 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3100
South Elevation Bays 3 and 4 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3101
South Elevation Bay 5 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3102
East Elevation Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3103
North Elevation Bays 4 and 5 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3104
North Elevation Bay 2 and 3 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3105
North Elevation Bay 1 Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3106
West Elevation Structural Repairs 220627-CON-XX-00-DR-S-3107
Typical Structural Repairs Detail Sheet 1 220627-CON-XX-ZZ-DR-S-4001
Typical Structural Repairs Detail Sheet 2 220627-CON-XX-ZZ-DR-S-4002
Typical Structural Repairs Detail Sheet 3 220627-CON-XX-ZZ-DR-S-4003
Stone Repair Details 220627-CON-XX-ZZ-DR-S-4004
Construction Method Statement
Design and Access Statement
Heritage Statement

Received by the City Council, as Local Planning Authority, on the 11 May 2023:
Proposed Bay 1 275 / PD / 210A
Proposed Bay 2 275 / PD / 211A
Proposed Bay 3 275 / PD / 212A

Received by the City Council, as Local Planning Authority, on the 26 June 2023:
Design Note

Reason - To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans pursuant to Core Strategy policies SP1, DM1, and EN3 and saved Unitary Development Plan policy DC19.

3) Notwithstanding the details as set out in condition 2 above, prior to the work being carried out, the final details and dimensions of the window frame shall be submitted and approved by the City Council as Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building and to ensure consistency in accordance with policy and EN3 of the Core Strategy and saved policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

Appendix 1 – List of consultees & neighbours notified

Heritage & Urban Design
Historic England (North West)
National Amenity Societies

Appendix 2 – Planning constraints

Article 4 Direction - Removal Of PD Rights Change Of Use From Class C3 To Class C4
Article 4 Direction - City Centre PD Restriction - Class B1(a) To C3
Aircraft Safeguarding Zone - Aircraft Safeguarding Zone - All Exceeding 90M
Coal Authority - Development Low Risk - Name: DEVELOPMENT_LOW_RISK_AREA
Conservation Area - Castlefield Conservation Area 1979
Flood Zones Type 2 (low to medium risk) -
Area Team Boundary - Name: CENTRAL