Economic Development

The provision of additional facilities will support a key employment area and the delivery of the service clustering strategy for North City Centre. The improvements to the area have already generated around 200 new jobs; the proposals give the opportunity to extend this benefit further. The project will also contribute to the strategic approach of promoting a mix of shops and services within the Centre contributing to its vitality and viability.

Education

By providing additional space for post-16 education the facility will further broaden the learning opportunities for aspiring young people to pursue their education in North Manchester bringing the benefits of an active student population to the area. Although the approach to regeneration and education focuses on strategic issues and aims not to be simply buildings led the importance of high quality physical premises should not be underestimated. The North Manchester Sixth Form College is one such quality building that inspires confidence, aspiration and achievement and the opportunity to extend this facility to the same high quality standards should not be ignored.

Community Character and Cohesion

North Manchester needs to celebrate its landmarks to provide visual cues and cultural reference points. The positive impact it can have on the experience of being a resident of North Manchester and on visitors to the area is important to the strategy for regeneration of the area. The Harpurhey Baths is a key physical landmark that has a long social history associated with the area. The proposed reuse of the building provides an opportunity to bring a historic character building back into

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

meaningful use within a public domain that will celebrate and reinforce the history of the area. The proposals include space that can be used by the local community for events to promote community spirit and cohesion. It further provides an opportunity to bring another building with a high level of quality in design and construction to the area thereby improving the image of the area for residents and visitors.

8.3 Alterations and Extensions

PPG15 Para 3.12 *Many listed buildings are already in well-established uses, and any changes need be considered only in this context. But where new uses are proposed, it is important to balance the effect of any changes on the special interest of the listed building against the viability of any proposed use and of alternative, and possibly less damaging, uses...*

Response: An assessment of the special interest of the Harpurhey Baths and its setting is derived in the first instance, from the listing description as outlined in 2.2 Statutory Sites of this report, and also by having regard to the Revisions to the Principles of Selection for Listing Buildings (2007). Whilst its historical public use is well established, the property has been unoccupied and in a deteriorating state for the last seventeen years.

It is considered that the proposed alterations and extensions reflect a carefully-considered balance of the effect of the proposed change of use on the special interest of the listed building against the viability of alternatives. In the response to PPG 15 Para 3.19 iii of this report, consideration regarding the overall effect of the alternatives explored confirms that the proposed development will meet the College's educational requirements while employing an approach that is considered less damaging to the special interest of the place than

those alternatives, which would have been architecturally and structurally more straightforward to implement.

It is therefore considered that the overall effect of the proposed alterations and extensions on the special interest of the Harpurhey Baths would be substantial and in many respects, beneficial. In addition, these works would entail the property being brought back into desirable use in such a manner so as to produce considerable long-term community benefits, which is discussed further in the response to PPG 15 Para 3.5 iv of this report.

PPG15 Para 3.13 *Many listed buildings can sustain some degree of sensitive alteration or extension to accommodate continuing or new uses....and the merit of some new alterations or additions, especially where they are generated within a secure and committed long-term ownership, should not be discounted. Nevertheless, listed buildings do vary greatly in the extent to which they can accommodate change without loss of special interest...*

Response: It is considered that the proposed development will rectify a substantial construction deficiency, which has contributed extensively to the physical condition of the Male Pool Halls. Such evidence was exposed during Phase 1 investigations, where the inherent challenges of embedded steel within tightly-packed masonry floor and wall assemblies in a predominantly wet environment produced conditions that necessitate considerable intervention. This requirement will extend across uses and is not particular to the educational use being proposed.

The substantial volumes, which are characteristic of the Male Pool Hall interiors, will serve to illustrate the degree of change that can be accommodated in relation to the 2nd Class Male pool Hall, versus the degree of change that can be accommodated in relation to the 1st

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

Harpurhey Baths, Rochdale, Manchester
PPG 15 JUSTIFICATION STATEMENT
April 2008

Class Pool Hall. In this regard, the proposed development acknowledges the special interest of both pool halls where the west gables of each contribute to the special interest in townscape values; where the massing and form of both are of considerable special interest and where the retention of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall is considered to embrace its spatial qualities, historical and social hierarchical relationship to the Male Entrance Building as well as its substantial contribution to townscape values.

The entire Male Entrance Building will be retained with minor alterations that are necessary to enable it to be fully accessible and to facilitate operational and educational requirements such as its linkage to the completed Phase I Sixth Form College and Library to the immediate south. In relation to the original plan form as depicted in Figure 3, the proposed development acknowledges the sensitivities inherent in the intricately detailed interior and as such, the degree of change in this area can be accommodated without adversely affecting its special interest.

On balance, it is considered that the Harpurhey Baths can accommodate the degree of alteration and extension proposed by Walker Simpson Architects and Ove Arup & Partners Ltd. That the proposed developed is being generated by a secure and committed long-term owner is considered to be of material importance in response to this policy guidance.

8.4 Demolitions

PPG 15 Para 3.16 *While it is an objective of Government policy to secure the preservation of historic buildings, there will very occasionally be cases where demolition is unavoidable. Listed building controls ensure that proposals for demolition are fully scrutinised before any decision is reached...The destruction of historic buildings*

is in fact very seldom necessary for reasons of good planning: more often it is the result of neglect, or of failure to make imaginative efforts to find new uses for them or to incorporate them into new development.

Response: The proposed development does not constitute "demolition"; however it is acknowledged that the Council has determined that the scope of proposed intervention would amount to "substantial demolition". In this regard, Paras 3.16-3.19 have also been addressed in this justification statement.

The proposed development demonstrates careful planning by its retention and substantive restoration of the Male Entrance Building; by the imaginative efforts to develop a balance between the spatial, functional and technical requirements of the expanded education offer for the 1st Class Male Pool Hall; and by substantially constructing the form and features that make a positive contribution to the character of the townscape in relation to the 2nd Class Pool Hall.

In this regard, the measures evident to incorporate the Harpurhey Baths into the new development have produced a converse incorporation, where the new development will actually be woven through and incorporated within the most significant form and features of the Harpurhey Baths.

PPG 15 Para 3.17 *...the Secretaries of State would not expect consent to be given for the total or substantial demolition of any listed building without clear and convincing evidence that all reasonable efforts have been made to sustain existing uses or find viable new uses, and these efforts have failed; that preservation in some form of charitable or community ownership is not possible or suitable (see paragraph 3.11); or that redevelopment would produce substantial benefits for the community which would decisively outweigh the loss resulting from demolition...*

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

Response: The College has undertaken to find a viable new use for a substantial portion of the listed building without redevelopment of the site in a manner that meets its educational requirements while still producing substantial benefits for the community. In this case, the retention of the most significant elements of the listed building including the substantive restoration of the Male Entrance Building is not considered to be the most attractive in straight economic terms. The College has embraced the special interest of the listed building with the challenge of addressing its inherent construction deficiencies and functional requirements within viable financial parameters.

The clear and convincing case for modifying the scope of intervention, which was consented in 2003, is therefore discussed in:

- *Rochdale Road Phase II Structural Report on Harpurhey Baths Buildings*, prepared by ARUP and documented in the Detailed Condition Assessment of the Male Entrance Building prepared by Heritage Architecture Ltd, with regard to its inherent physical condition;
- *Historic Report: Architectural & Social History of the Harpurhey Baths (June 2004)* and Significance Plans prepared by Heritage Architecture Ltd, with regard to special interest;
- in the response to PPG 15 Para 3.19 iii, with regard to alternatives considered;
- in the Educational Statement included in the Design Statement prepared by Walker Simpson Architects and in the response to PPG 15 Para 3.5 iv (Education) with regard to the educational requirements on the site;
- in the response to PPG 15 Annex C – Guidance to Alterations to Listed Buildings and in response to BS 7913 with regard to the "effects" of the proposed development; and

- in response to PPG 15 Para 3.5 iv (Economic Development and Community Character and Cohesion) with regard to the overall community benefit.

PPG15 Para 3.19: *Where proposed works would result in the total or substantial demolition of the listed building, or any significant part of it, the Secretaries of State would expect the authority, in addition to the general considerations set out in paragraph 3.5 above, to address the following considerations:*

i. the condition of the building, the cost of repairing and maintaining it in relation to its importance and to the value derived from its continued use. Any such assessment should be based on consistent and long-term assumptions...

Response: The Council has determined that the proposed works involving the demolition of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall would result in the substantial demolition of the listed building. In this regard, condition of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall has been addressed in *Rochdale Road Phase II Structural Report on Harpurhey Baths* dated April 2008. In that report, investigations undertaken by ARUP confirm that the inherent constructional defects such as embedded steel within tightly-packed masonry walls; slender upper gable walls; lack of roof bracing and the apparent minimal tying of the inner glazed brickwork stretcher bond skin and the outer leaf brickwork, that were present in the Female Baths were also incorporated into the construction of the Male Pool Halls. The Male Pool Halls show evidence of deterioration that is concealed within the structure, thus necessitating significant and invasive intervention to gain access, remove corrosion, treat steel members and rebuild. Examples of this includes the corrosion of

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

embedded steel columns and bearing ends of roof trusses; the corrosion and loss of section of steel floor joists; cracking and bulging of walls not associated with embedded steelwork; and failure of the balcony support brackets.

While it would be possible to undertake this type of intervention, the structural system itself is considered to be inadequate to sustain the loading that would result from the new use. The extent of rebuilding of floors, walls and roofs then raises matters of practicality, viability and authenticity. Further, such an extensive intervention would not yield the spatial requirements of the College to effectively deliver its educational programs.

The cost of repairing the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall has been estimated by Simon Fenton Partnership LLP (Chartered Quantity Surveyors and Project Managers) to be £1,746,990. In relation to its importance and the value derived from its continued use, it is acknowledged that the Male Pool Halls ceased to fulfil their function seventeen years ago and their reuse for the College's educational offer was based on long-term assumptions and consented in 2003 as part of Phase 1 of the Harpurhey Baths development. With regard to this application (Phase II) the College confirms that the retention of the existing 2nd Class Male Pool Hall would not satisfy the education case and therefore no value would be derived from its retention.

ii. the adequacy of efforts made to retain the building in use…

Response: Efforts made to retain the 2nd Class Pool Hall in its original use ceased in 2001. The College's commitment to utilise the site to deliver its expanding educational offer was consented in 2003. The current application continues the thrust of that which was consented; however, it proposes to concentrate the requirement for additional classroom space within the footprint of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall. In

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

relation to the special interest of the listed building, considerable effort has been invested into retaining those aspects of the Harpurhey Baths which make the most significant contribution to its special interest combined with rebuilding the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall to address inherent structural defects with the existing structure; achieving its educational and operational requirements; while offering continuity of the form and expression that is recognised as having high significance to the immediate townscape.

iii. the merits of alternative proposals for the site....There may very exceptionally be cases where the proposed works would bring substantial benefits for the community which have to be weighed against the arguments in favour of preservation. Even here, it will often be feasible to incorporate listed buildings within new development, and this option should be carefully considered: the challenge presented by retaining listed buildings can be a stimulus to imaginative new design to accommodate them.

Response: Alternative proposals for the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall have been considered. Each proposal sought to achieve the College's operational requirements and each option would result in varying degrees of impact on the special interest of the listed building as a whole. The alternatives explored and discussed with English Heritage and the Council are as follows:

Option 1 (consented in 2003) - Retain and renovate the listed building, which would include the three-storey Male Entrance Building and the two Male Pool Halls. The latter were to be opened up internally to form connecting halls and exhibition/performance space together with a large glazed opening created leading onto the community garden. The entrance building would provide teaching

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

facilities at ground floor with admin accommodation to the upper floors. The external fabric generally would be retained and replaced where necessary to match existing.

As a result of changing educational needs, alternative proposals were required to be investigated.

Option 2 - Whilst still retaining and refurbishing the Male Entrance Building, it was proposed that the two Male Pool Halls would be demolished and replaced by a new teaching block within the footprint of the existing pool halls but sympathetic to the adjacent sixth form teaching block.

Discussions with English Heritage and the Council lead the design team to develop a solution, which retained the character of the baths element whilst still addressing the educational need.

Option 3 (current proposal) - Whilst still retaining and refurbishing the Male Entrance Building, it was proposed that the internal volume and character of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall would be retained as the original concept. The 2nd Class Male Pool Hall would be demolished and rebuilt as a three storey teaching block with its massing to reflect the original.

The merits of alternative proposals have been developed and discussed with English Heritage. Given that the consented option no longer meets the changing requirements of the College, however, it is considered that Option 3 (as currently proposed) would meet the College's operational and educational requirements; involve a significantly lesser degree of impact on the special interest of the listed building than Option 2; and has attracted the support of both English Heritage and the Council.

The solution represented in Option 3 therefore incorporates the heritage, functional, financial, educational, technical and regeneration objectives to extend the 'guardian' activity for the Male Entrance

Building and 1st Class Male Pool Hall. At the present, the unoccupied structures enable continued constructional defects to advance the structural deterioration of the building; deterioration of the historic fabric through exposure; and physical damage to the structure. The expansion of the College's educational offer, which would reinstate full use of the deteriorating structures, is propelled by the success of Phase I that has already delivered considerable regeneration benefits to North Manchester.

A key conservation objective would be met by the proposed development in relation to keeping historic buildings in use. The Male Entrance Building and 2nd Class Male Pool Hall, which comprise the most significant components of the listed building will benefit from reinstating a full use once the physical deterioration of the fabric has been conserved. Such an investment would extend their life expectancy significantly with the accompanying townscape values, which together would have an overall long-term beneficial effect.

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture

9 ANNEX C – GUIDANCE ON ALTERATIONS TO LISTED BUILDINGS

9.1 General Principles

PPG15 Para C.1 *These guidelines are concerned principally with works that affect the special interest and character of a building and require listed building consent. The range of listed buildings is so great that they cannot be comprehensive, but they do summarise the characteristics and features which make up the special interest of most listed buildings and which should be given full weight in the process of judging listed building consent applications, alongside other considerations - in particular the importance of keeping listed buildings in viable economic use whenever possible…*

Response: Detailed consideration of Annex C has informed the basis for this justification statement, while having regard to the importance of maintaining and extending the economic and physical usefulness of Harpurhey Baths as an integral part of North Manchester's economic and urban fabric well into the future.

PPG15 Para C.2 *Each historic building has its own characteristics which are usually related to an original or subsequent function. These should as far as possible be respected when proposals for alterations are put forward…*

Response: The original characteristics, including plan form, orientation, and arrangement of external openings and interior features of special interest are respected by the proposed alterations and extensions in relation to the highly significant Male Entrance

Building.

With regard to the pool halls, their original function ceased to have relevance in this location when the new leisure centre built to modern standards addressed a much higher user expectation nearby. The characteristics related to the original function of the pool halls will be adapted and/or rebuilt to accommodate a different function as discussed in response to Para 3.13 of this report in the Design Statement prepared by Walker Simpson Architects; and in the Structural Renovations Proposals prepared by ARUP (Appendix 5 to this report). In relation to the 1st Class Pool Hall for example, the characteristics which contribute to its special interest are respected as far as practicable, given the requirements of the particular educational offer. In particular, the special interest derived from its spatial qualities, naturally lit by the striking roof light, will be retained by the proposed development. The special interest derived from the characteristics of roof forms and features will be retained in the 1st Class Male Pool Hall and rebuilt in the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall, ensuring that the overall historic built form remains dominant and clearly recognisable in the community consciousness.

The new function represented in this application will essentially extend the Sixth Form College and Library use on the site, which received consent in a previous application from the Secretary of State in 2003.

PPG15 Para C.3 *Alterations should be based on a proper understanding of the structure. Some listed buildings may suffer from structural defects arising from their age, methods of construction or past use, but can still give adequate service provided they are not subject to major disturbance. Repairs should usually be low-key, re-instating or strengthening the structure only where appropriate; such repairs may sometimes require listed building consent. New work should be fitted to the old to ensure the survival of as much historic*

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

fabric as is practical. Old work should not be sacrificed merely to accommodate the new.

PPG15 Para C.6 *In general the wholesale reinstatement of lost, destroyed or superseded elements of a building or an interior is not appropriate, although, where a building has largely retained the integrity of its design, the reinstatement of lost or destroyed elements of that design could be considered. In such cases there should always be adequate information confirming the detailed historical authenticity of the work proposed…*

Response: In general, the proposed works do not include the wholesale reinstatement of lost elements, with the exception of stained glass features and light fixtures at the base of staircases. Such reinstatement will be based on archival photographs and specialist knowledge of the detailing of such work to confirm the historic authenticity of the proposed work.

PPG15 Para C.7 *Modern extensions should not dominate the existing building in either scale, material or situation…*

Response: The construction of the flat-roof glazed link between the south side of the Male Entrance Building and the existing north elevation of the 6th Form College is sufficiently set back from the listed building so as not to visually challenge the listed building. It is proposed that the link would be tucked under the eaves of the listed building to acknowledge its subordinate relationship to the listed building and be constructed as a lightweight glazed structure allowing partial views of the red brick gabled elevation of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall to be seen above the Panini and glimpses of the south elevation of the same pool hall below and through the glazed bridge link.

© Building Design Partnership Limited

The proposed lift overrun is also located in an area that will reduce the potential visual impact. The proposed glazed projection above the sloping gable parapet of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall will be visible largely from Sheppard Street, however it is not considered to be of such a scale so as to visually challenge the integrity of the setting of the listed building.

Minor modern interventions such as the application of glazed canopies are not considered to visually challenge the special interest of the listed building to a degree that would be more than minor. It is therefore considered that the proposed modern extensions are of a scale, bulk and location, which do not challenge or diminish the setting of Harpurhey Baths to a degree that would be considered "dominating".

It is considered that the proposed extensions will be subservient to the existing building in scale, material or location. This matter is also discussed in more detail in response to BS 7913, *New works*; and *The juxtaposition of old and new work*. In this regard, it is considered that the proposed extension reflects an intimate knowledge of Harpurhey Baths and its sensitive handling of scale would be beneficial to its special interest.

9.2 External Elevations

PPG15 Para C.8 Walls: *Walls are the main structural fabric of a building...Alterations or repairs to external elevations should respect the existing fabric and match it in materials, texture, quality and colour...*

Response: The proposed works to the exterior of Harpurhey Baths which includes following treatment to walls:

© Sutcher Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

- retention and repairs to the exterior load-bearing masonry walls of the Male Entrance Building;
- retention and strengthening the gable walls of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall with stainless-steel ties;
- retention and re-cladding the north and south walls of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall with an outer leaf of brickwork;
- retention of the pool tank walls to support a new suspended floor slab;
- retention and alteration to external basement retaining walls; and
- removal of the exterior walls of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall and rebuilding a new structure clad in masonry so as to match the existing brickwork

It is considered that the above proposed interventions are necessary to correct the inherent constructional defects and to implement the substantial repairs, strengthening and new build elements, all of which have been designed to respect the existing fabric and to match it materially. Every effort will be made to retain or re-use the existing sound brickwork as outlined in the plans prepared by Walker Simpson Architects; described in the *Rochdale Road Phase II Structural Report on Harpuhey Baths Buildings* and sketches prepared by Ove Arup & Partners Ltd, and identified in the Salvage and Recording Schedule prepared by Heritage Architecture Ltd.

PPG15 Para C.9 Openings: *Door and window openings establish the character of an elevation; they should not generally be altered in their proportions or details, especially where they are a conspicuous element of the design…*

Response: Existing exterior door and window openings associated with the Male Entrance Building will be retained. The most notable intervention to the historic fabric will occur on the south elevation of the Male Entrance Building in order to accommodate access to the Panini café from the ground floor and access to the Bridge Link at the first floor. This aspect of the proposed development will be a conspicuous element of the design when viewed from Rochdale Road however, it is not considered to detract from the setting of the listed building to a degree that would be considered substantial.

Internal openings within the Male Entrance Building are largely retained as original; however, in those locations where conspicuous elements of the design include an existing opening that is proposed to be blocked, the infill will be recessed so as to allow a clear reading of the position, detail and plan form relationship of the opening. Features that make up the special interest of openings will be retained and repaired insitu or removed for detailed investigations; repaired and reinstated to their original positions.

PPG 15 Para C.10-11: *Pointing*

PPG 15 Para C.12-15: *Plaster and render*

PPG 15 Para C.16: *Timber Frames*

PPG 15 Para C.17: *Exterior Painting*

PPG 15 Para C.18: *Exterior Cleaning*

PPG 15 Para C.19: *Wrought Iron and Cast Iron*

PPG 15 Para C.24: *Exterior Plumbing*

Response: Consideration of the above policy guidance (External

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

Elevations) and PPG 15 Paragraphs C.30, C.31, C.36, C.39, C.40-47, C.48, C.49-51, C.60-63, and C.64 relating to materials and methods are addressed in the *Detailed Condition Assessment & Schedule of Repairs for the Male Entrance Building*; the *Historic Fabric Salvage & Recording Brief & Methodology for the Male's 1st and 2nd Class Swimming Baths*, and the Specifications prepared by Heritage Architecture Ltd in April 2008; in conjunction with the *Rochdale Road Phase II Structural Report on Harpurhey Baths Buildings*, prepared by Ove Arup & Partners Ltd in April 2008.

PPG15 Para C.25 Inscriptions and other features: *Inscriptions, old lettering, old shop signs, inn sign boards, date plaques and stones, coats of arms, monograms, fire insurance plaques, commemorative or symbolic carvings and statues in niches are part of the history of a building. These features should be retained in situ wherever possible...*

Response: All inscriptions and plaques such as the red granite plaque affixed to the Male Entrance Building, which face Rochdale Road, will be conserved.

9.3 Roofs

PPG15 Para C.27 *The roof is nearly always a dominant feature of a building and the retention of its original structure, shape, pitch, cladding and ornament is important.*

Response: The roof forms of Harpurhey Baths are considered amongst the most dominant external features of the original Male Pool Halls. This has been acknowledged in the consented scheme of 2003, and also in recent discussions held with English Heritage and the

Council. The importance of this aspect of the building's special interest is now reflected in the proposed development.

PPG 15 Para C.30: *Slates and tiles*

PPG 15 Para C.31: *Lead and copper*

Response: Refer to response at 1.3.3 External Elevations of this report.

PPG15 Para C.33 Dormers and rooflights: *Early dormers, especially of the 17th or 18th century pedimented type, should be retained and carefully repaired. If beyond repair they should be reconstructed with all details reproduced. Enlargement of existing dormers on principal elevations should normally be avoided.*

Response: Roof lights throughout the listed building are conspicuous elements of the design and make a significant contribution to the character and quality of internal spaces. These will be retained and repaired in relation to the Male Entrance Building and the 1st Class Male Pool Hall. With regard to the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall, the central roof light will be reconstructed as part of the proposed rebuilding of the exterior form and detail which presently exists.

The roofing material proposed will largely consist of the re-use of existing slates and re-roofing of residual areas to match the historic finish and coursing of the listed building.

PPG 15 Para C.36: *Chimney stacks and pots*

Response: Refer to response at 1.3.3 External Elevations of this report.

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

9.4 External Doors

PPG15 Para C.37 Doors and doorways: *Original doorways and any surviving original doors should be retained…*

Response: All historic doors and doorways that can be repaired will be repaired and those doors determined to be too deteriorated to be repaired will be replaced in kind. This is also a consistent approach, widely-recognised in conservation principles.

PPG 15 Para C.39: *Door detail*

Response: Refer to response at 1.3.3 External Elevations of this report.

9.5 Windows

PPG 15 Para C.40-47

PPG 15 Para C.48: *Old Glass*

PPG 15 Para C.49-51: *Replacement Windows*

Response: Refer to response at 1.3.3 External Elevations of this report.

9.6 Interiors

PPG15 Para C.58 *The plan of a building is one of its most important characteristics. Interior plans and individual features of interest should be respected and left unaltered as far as possible. Internal spaces, staircases, panelling, window shutters, doors and doorcases, mouldings, decorated ceilings, stucco-work, and wall-decorations are part of the special interest of a building and may be its most valuable feature.*

Response: The large irregular footprint form of Harpurhey Baths would remain largely unaltered by the proposed development with the exception of the corridor extension to the west of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall, to enable the construction of a Panini cafe.

The proposed development acknowledges the strict hierarchy of the complex that distinguished classes and genders. The strong historical relationship between the Male Entrance Building and the 1st Class Male Pool Hall has been maintained in the proposed layout. As part of the proposed works to the Male Entrance Building, the original design intent reflected in Fig. 2 will be restored and the original plan form of the Male Entrance Building would remain substantially unaltered. Alterations proposed for the interior of the ground and first floors are concentrated within the footprint of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall.

While infilling the main access doors to the 2nd Class Pool Hall will alter the legibility of the original plan form, the proposed reinstatement of the deteriorated or missing features within the Male Entrance Building will reinforce elements of the plan form considered to be of special interest and will enable the hierarchical relationship between the two baths to be accentuated by the proposed development.

The proposed minor alterations to create doorways in the original fabric at the ground floor level are considered to be acceptable and do

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

not affect the historic plan form to a degree that would be more than minor.

First floor alterations are also concentrated within the footprint of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall with additional interventions to construct the lift and link to the Sixth Form College & Library to the south.

The above alterations still maintain the general plan form and thus an important aspect of its special interest.

In this regard, it is considered that important plan features will be enhanced by the proposed alterations and new construction, thus satisfying the above planning and policy guidance.

PPG15 Para C.59 Walls: *Internal walls in old buildings should always be investigated with care in advance of alterations in case ancient or interesting features are hidden in the plaster or behind the panelling or other covering...*

Response: Harpurhey Baths has been investigated;

- in 1995, by Bingham Cottrell, regarding extensive corrosion to the steelwork;
- in 2000, by Clancy Consulting, regarding steelwork;
- in 2003, by Barry Green Associates, regarding intrusive structural investigations;
- in 2003, by Heritage Architecture Ltd as part of its historical research;
- in 2003, by ARUP, regarding the overall structural condition of the Harpurhey Baths;

- in 2005, by Ridout Associates, regarding the Timber Survey;
- in 2008, by Heritage Architecture Ltd, regarding a detailed condition assessment of the Male Entrance Building; and
- in 2008, by ARUP, to update their 2003 structural condition report

These investigations served to inform interventions proposed for Rochdale Road Phase II. In addition, the structural investigations have enabled the formulation of brief method statements for the proposed works, which in turn has enabled the consideration of potential risks of certain interventions.

In this regard, it is considered that any new partitions within the original structure have been kept to a minimum.

PPG 15 Para C.60 *Plasterwork*

PPG 15 Para C.62 *Staircases*

PPG 15 Para C.63 *Interior paint and decoration*

Response: Refer to response at 1.3.3 External Elevations of this report.

9.7 Floors

PPG15 Para C.65 Floor strengthening: *Proposals for floor strengthening often form part of refurbishment schemes...These are almost always at variance with the architectural and structural integrity of a historic building and should not normally be regarded as a sufficient justification for major alterations. The floors of most historic*

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

buildings can be made perfectly adequate for the actual loads they will carry.

It has been confirmed by ARUP that the existing unreinforced concrete pool surround slabs would not sustain the loading requirements of the new use. Further, these slabs are supported by steel joists, which show evidence of corrosion and structural unsoundness.

To fully rectify the existing inherent contractual defects, meet current loading and fire-resistance rating requirements, the floor slabs will be replaced in kind. In this regard, it is not considered that the existing floor assembly can be made adequate for the intended loads that they will be expected to carry.

With regard to the Male Entrance Building, the construction assembly is quite different, being of timber, where the condition of floor joists is subject to localised areas of dry and wet rot. Here, only the portion of deteriorated structure (the extent will vary depending on whether it is dry or wet rot, however the latter is much more prevalent) will be removed, repaired/replaced and/or strengthened. In this instance, the floor can be adequately treated to sustain the loading anticipated by the new use.

PPG15 Para C.67 *Often the pressure for floor strengthening and replacement arises from the presence of dry rot within the structural members. Dry rot eradication can rapidly lead to the progressive stripping and dismantling of a building. In every case where remedial works are proposed, the minimum works necessary should be carried out after detailed discussion. The use of new techniques requiring the minimum removal of timber should be encouraged.*

Response: The approach that will be taken with regard to addressing both dry and wet rot is based on minimum intervention and will be covered in the Conservation Specification to be prepared by Heritage Architecture Ltd. This may be further informed by the updated Timber Survey undertaken in 2005 and further updated in 2008 by Ridout Associates.

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

10 TEMPORARY PROTECTION PLAN ADVICE

A *temporary protection plan* is a clear identification of the potential risks to the listed building with recommended measures to mitigate such risks. It has been formulated having regard to the proposed plans as prepared by Walker Simpson Architects, dated April 2008, and the Rochdale Road Phase II Structural Report on Harpurhey Baths Buildings, prepared Ove Arup & Partners Ltd, dated April 2008.

ACTIVITY	POTENTIAL RISK OF DAMAGE TO HISTORIC STRUCTURE	PROPOSED MITIGATION MEASURES
1. Documentation	Insufficient documentation of the Male Pool Halls before construction activity begins.	To fully document the existing condition of the 1st and 2nd Class Male Pool Hall at a Level 3 record. Such a record should be in accordance with *Understanding Historic Buildings, A guide to good recording practice*, published by English Heritage (2006). To ensure that such an investigation provides a "baseline" from which changes to the building during the any nearby construction can be identified, monitored and assessed.
2. Communication	If construction issues related to the listed building are not considered in advance by the various disciplines involved in the project, the listed building may be at risk.	Pre-construction meetings will address issues arising from the consented works. Most important, the parties will reach an understanding about what steps will be taken to protect the listed building. Responsibility for implementing the agreed upon protections will be established between the College's project management team, the Heritage Consultant and relevant subcontractors. Such decisions will be listed in performance specifications that accompany agreements between the contractor and the developer.
3. Nearby Construction	New construction precedes conservation work to the retained listed building. Damage to the retained Male Entrance Building or 1st Class Male Pool Hall during the removal of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall. Tools and methods used in selective demolition (such as impact hammers, wrecking balls and pavement breakers) may be transmitted to the remainder of the listed building.	To consider the exposure of those portions of retained structure in relation to the nature and sequence of construction activity on the site. Protect the remaining listed building from damage related to site preparation required for the construction of the new three-storey structure to occupy the footprint of the existing 2nd Class Male Pool Hall. Long-term stability of the retained listed building will be reinstated by propping/tying action from the new framed building to be constructed over the footprint of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall.

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

ACTIVITY	POTENTIAL RISK OF DAMAGE TO HISTORIC STRUCTURE	PROPOSED MITIGATION MEASURES
4. Movement	Ground displacement and movement of an adjacent historic building caused by excavation and foundation work, particularly where foundations are much deeper than the foundations of the adjacent listed building. Movement or collapse of external basement retaining walls.	To use engineered underpinning or strengthening of excavation walls with tie backs in order to resist movement of the adjacent structure.
5. Vibrations	Vibrations may be caused by increased truck traffic accompanying new construction or demolition work.	To locate delivery entry and exit points for construction traffic well away from that portion of the listed building that is being retained insitu.
6. Changes in Water Level	Debris originating at the construction site, finding its way to the gutters, downspouts and drains of the adjacent heritage building.	To conduct regular visual inspections, including the checking of gutters, valleys and exposed drains for any obstructions. To document any indications of dampness or water damage where gutters and downspouts meet other building surfaces.
7. Physical Impact	Direct physical damage to adjacent historic features and materials caused by cranes and hoists on a construction site including workers dropping building supplies and tools onto the adjacent Male Entrance Building or 1st Class Male Pool Hall. Misdirected debris chutes and backing vehicles may also place the historic building at risk. Compromised structural stability of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall resulting from the new opening to be formed in the south wall. Destabilisation of the retained structure resulting from the removal of the lean-to structures on the south elevation and the single storey structure to the west gable.	Protective barriers will be placed over any area of the heritage structure deemed at risk. Where new construction rises above the heritage building, plywood sheets will be placed over it to distribute the force of dropped materials.

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

ACTIVITY	POTENTIAL RISK OF DAMAGE TO HISTORIC STRUCTURE	PROPOSED MITIGATION MEASURES
7. Physical Impact (continued)	Cutting of the built-in brackets at the wall face.	
8. Spills	Spills of construction materials on to the historic fabric may result in irreversible damage.	Historic facades will be covered as a means of protecting it against mortar drops, cleaning solvents, and tar and asphalt splash.
9. Monitoring		Thresholds will be established to take into account surrounding soils, the makeup and condition of the adjacent foundation and the particular vulnerabilities of the historic building. A program of on-site testing will be conducted before work begins, where excavation next to historic buildings is proposed. Testing various charges, delays and impacts from pile-driving will aid in developing a controlled program that limits construction-induced damage to a structure. A monitoring program will be undertaken to detect, gauge, record and interpret structural movement, the effects of vibration and other changes to the retained listed building that may result from adjacent construction.
	Moisture entrapment around cleaned steelwork to be encased in concrete.	
10. Temporary Support and/or Protection	Damage to historic fabric of the listed building resulting from the temporary support installed during selective demolition, alteration and/or extension. Transverse instability of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall resulting from the removal of the cantilevered balcony.	Historic fabric shall be protected from temporary support and no penetrations such as bolts, nails, etc. are to be used. All temporary supports should be signed off by Ove Arup & Partners Ltd. Installation of temporary propping.

ACTIVITY	POTENTIAL RISK OF DAMAGE TO HISTORIC STRUCTURE	PROPOSED MITIGATION MEASURES
11. Historic finishes	Damage to historic fabric such as the removal of and storage of the changing cubicles. Damage to glazed brickwork during opening up to gain access to corroded column heads and roof truss bearings and during the fixing of the outer leaf. Damage to glazed brick resulting from the formation of new openings. Alteration of historic exterior detailing resulting from addition of the new masonry outer leaf. Delayed construction start, further extending the exposure of the listed building to the elements and potential damage by unauthorised access.	Protect exposed or vulnerable historic fabric with bubble-wrap, foam rubber, expanded polystyrene, plywood, self-adhesive Poli-film or the like. Do not fix any temporary protection to historic fabric with screws, nails, adhesives or the like.

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

11 CONCLUSION

11.1 Consultation

It is of particular relevance to acknowledge that considerable initiative of the College and Project Design Team included consultation with the officers of Manchester City Council in order to refine and formulate the proposals. Of particular note was English Heritage's commendation regarding the approach being taken with regard to the Main Entrance Building and their preference for a scheme that responded to the historical and social interest of the Male Pool Halls that would give meaning to the purpose of the Male Entrance Building through refurbishment rather than reconstruction of the 1st Class Male Pool Hall. The design revisions following this consultation by Walker Simpson Architects and Ove Arup & Partners has produced a scheme that rises to meet the challenge of multiple objectives evident in the buildings' architectural, heritage, structural, educational and regeneration capacity.

11.2 Historic Fabric

This justification statement set out to outline why the proposed works, which would affect the special interest of the Harpurhey Baths were desirable and/or necessary.

Effects of the proposed development on the special interest of the listed building may be adverse, neutral or beneficial. It is considered that the proposed works would have effects on the historic fabric of the Harpurhey Baths that range from minor to significant. For example:

- Works such as the proposed removal of the 2nd Class Male Pool Hall will have a significant impact on the historic fabric;

however, the effect of the inherent constructional defects and overall deteriorating condition of the fabric is already significant and adverse.

- The retention and conservation of the historic fabric comprising the Male Entrance Building is a substantial undertaking that will have significant beneficial effects.
- While the construction of a new reinforced concrete slab floor over the existing pool may challenge future reversibility options, the retention of the basement areas for service/plant and/or storage is considered beneficial.
- The approach to materials and details is conservation-based, including such interventions as the careful removal of historic slates and re-installation over an upgraded roof assembly; the opening up of semi-circular gable openings to incorporate glazing consistent with the original design concept; and the salvaging of materials for re-use on the site are considered beneficial to the special interest of the place.
- Interior works to the 1st Class Male Pool Hall, which are "alterations and/or new work", considered to be additional or of a substantially different nature to that which was consented in 2003, would likely generate a range of minor effects, however it is not considered that any adverse effects would be significant.
- Enhancing the efficiency and performance of the listed building such as incorporating insulation into a strengthened roof and wall assemblies; replacing the un-reinforced concrete pool surround with a higher capacity reinforced concrete slab that incorporates adequate fire-resistance ratings; and replacing the current roof glazing with automatic ventilating units to match the existing appearance of the roof lights are all

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

considered to have varying intrusive effects on the historic fabric, which, in this instance, are considered to be acceptable interventions that will have long-term beneficial effects.

- It is considered that the proposed works such as the construction of the Panini café are desirable and are considered to be an acceptable intervention on the special interest of the Harpurhey Baths.
- The nature and proximity of likely construction activity raises the potential for impacts on the historic fabric not assessed in this report. In conjunction with Ove Arup & Partners, notable risks have been identified to raise awareness of matters that will require on-site mitigation. Forward planning of responses to unforeseen circumstances that could affect the historic fabric is considered extremely beneficial.

11.3 Visual Impact

This justification statement also sets out to assess the potential or actual visual impact likely to result from the proposed extensions, on the special interest of the Harpurhey Baths.

It is concluded that the visual impact likely to result from the proposed extensions, particularly as viewed from Rochdale Road will not detract from the setting of the Harpurhey Baths. Given that the principle form and features that make the most notable contribution to the character of the setting would be sustained by the proposed development, it is considered that the overall visual impact as seen from Viewpoint 1 would be major and beneficial. With regard to the visual impact as experienced from Viewpoint 2, the works proposed were consented in 2003 and it is considered that the low magnitude of change on the high receptor sensitivity site would be moderate and beneficial.

11.4 Overview

It is acknowledged that the Harpurhey Baths is an important landmark whose historic and proposed use is firmly rooted into the North Manchester community. The character of the application site is largely formed by the substantial neo-Baroque style Male Entrance Building built to back of pavement, with its characteristic English Garden Wall bond red brick and buff terracotta finish; keyed arched doorways; round-headed windows; steeply-pitched hipped roofs and tall chimneys. The proposed development seeks to repair the current condition of the Male Entrance Building, which detracts from its special interest and reinstate a new use which will reinvigorate the street scene. The new extensions respond to the listed building's special architectural and historic interest through the strategic insertion of new-build elements into the repaired, strengthened and conserved historic fabric.

It is therefore concluded that the proposed works satisfy the spirit of relevant clauses of PPG 15 as detailed above; are consistent with the general thrust of local policies and national conservation principles and therefore ought to be granted Listed Building Consent, with reserved matters as appropriate.

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd

12 REFERENCES

- Digimap map reference tool
- Hartwell, C. (2004) The Buildings of England, Lancashire: Manchester and the South-East
- Manchester City Council, (1995), The Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester
- Manchester Central Library, archival photographic material
- Mynors, Charles, (2006), Listed Buildings, Conservation Areas and Monuments, Fourth Edition

13 APPENDICES

13.1 Appendix 1 - Detailed Condition Assessment & Schedule of Repairs for the Male Entrance Building

13.2 Appendix 2 - Gazetteer

13.3 Appendix 3 - Historic Fabric Salvage and Recording Brief for the 1st and 2nd Class Male Pool Halls

13.4 Appendix 4 - Rochdale Road Phase 2 Structural Report on Harpurhey Baths Buildings

© Stephen Levrant Heritage Architecture Ltd