

Planning

Growth & Development

Delegated officer report for planning application

Application no. 126801/VO/2020

Date registered valid: 27 April 2020

Proposal: CITY COUNCIL DEVELOPMENT Planning permission and Listed building consent for minor internal and external alterations to the basement level of the Town Hall associated with connections to the Manchester Civic Quarter Heat Network.

Address: Town Hall , Albert Square, Manchester, M2 5DB

Ward(s): Deansgate Ward

Applicant: Manchester City Council PO Box 532 Town Hall, Manchester, M60 2LA

Agent (if any): Jack Haw Turley 1 New York Street, Manchester, M1 4HD

Case officer: Emily Booth
Tel: 0161 234 4193
Email: e.booth@manchester.gov.uk

Recommendation: Approve

Date of recommendation: 19 June 2020

Application details

Type of application: Regulation 3 Consent

Development type: Minor Other

Date of site visit: 7 May 2020

Standard consultations:

Printed: 5 May 2020 Expired: 26 May 2020

Neighbour notifications

Printed: 5 May 2020 Expired: 26 May 2020

Site notice

Posted: 7 May 2020 Expired: 28 May 2020

Press advert

Published: 12 May 2020 Expired: 2 June 2020

Departure from Development Plan: No

Environmental Statement: Not required

Description of site/building

Listed building: Grade I

Conservation area: Albert Square Conservation Area 1972

Tree Preservation Order: Not applicable

Introduction

The Manchester Civic Quarter Heat Network (MCQHN) is part of the Greater Manchester Heat Network Programme, and has been designed to facilitate the efficient, cost-effective development of heat networks across the ten authorities of Greater Manchester, to support carbon and energy policy commitments both locally and nationally.

The Civic Quarter contains a number of key MCC-owned buildings, and the Council is committed to supplying them with low-carbon energy as well as demonstrating leadership to others in the city to do the same. In February 2011 MCC's Executive Committee agreed to support the concept of a city centre heat network and the delivery of the MCQHN as the first cluster in its development, subject to a viable business case and planning approval.

It is intended that the heat network would serve the Grade I Listed Manchester Art Gallery, Grade II* Listed Town Hall Extension, Grade II* Listed Central Library, Grade II* Listed Midland Hotel, Grade II* Listed Manchester Central, the Bridgewater Hall, Heron House and Number One St Peter's Square. Manchester Central, Manchester Town Hall Extension, the Midland Hotel and the Bridgewater Hall would also have an electrical connection. The building would require minor alteration to the basement to connect them to the energy supply.

Applications referenced:

118869/VO/2018,
118870/LO/2018,
118871/LO/2018,
118872/LO/2018,
118873/LO/2018
118874/LO/2018

were approved at Planning and Highways Committee on 8 March 2018 and planning permission and listed building consent were granted for the heat network, the energy centre and the connections to the above buildings. Permission is now sought to vary Condition 2 (Approved Drawings and Documents) of application referenced 118869/VO/2018.

Approval was subsequently granted in August 2019 to further extend the Heat Network to also serve the Town Hall (124260/VO/2019).

Applications referenced 125978/VO/2020 and 125979/LO/2020 were approved in March 2020 and allowed the installation of infill panels to 3 no. arches at the Grade II* Listed Manchester Central in connection with Manchester Civic Quarter Heat Network.

Applications referenced 126801/VO/2020 and 126802/LO/2020 are currently pending determination. These applications would allow internal and external alterations to the basement level of the Town Hall associated with connections to the Manchester Civic Quarter Heat Network.

Applications to discharge conditions referenced CDN/19/0478 and CDN/19/0684 have also previously been approved and allowed the discharge of conditions 3 (CMP - Heat Network), 4 (Arboriculture Method), 6 (Pavement Reinstatement), 7 (CMP - Energy Centre), 10 (Surface Water Drainage), 15 (Large Vehicle Access), 19 (External Illumination), 20 (Penetrative Methods) and 21 (Fume Extraction) and the partial discharge of conditions 5 (Archaeology), 8 (Contaminated Land, 9 (Materials to be Approved), 11 (Metrolink Maintenance), 12 (fire strategy), 13 (EMC Control Plan), 14 (Earthing Electrode) and 18 (NSE6 - External Equipment).

Application referenced 126436/JO/2020 allowed the variation of condition 2 (Approved Drawings) imposed upon planning approval reference 118869/JO/2018 to allow amendments to the approved design of the energy centre.

Description of area

Manchester Town Hall is a Grade I Listed Building in the Albert Square conservation area. It is part of the Town Hall Complex along with the Grade II* Listed Town Hall Extension, the Grade II* Listed Central Library, Library Walk, Albert Square and St Peter's Square. The Town Hall Complex is one of Manchester's greatest cultural and civic assets, which makes a significant contribution to the heritage and identity of the City. Manchester Town Hall is the most significant building in the Complex.

It fronts Albert Square which would be pedestrianised and re-landscaped (ref 124918/VO/2019); Princess Street, Lloyd Street and Cooper Street. Cooper Street adjoins St Peter's Square which has high quality public realm, high quality new development and highly graded listed buildings. The Square was redesigned and expanded between 2012 and 2017 and contains a Metrolink station and listed and unlisted statues, structures and monuments including the Grade II* Listed Cenotaph and the Grade II Listed St Peter's Cross. Lloyd Street is a one way vehicular route which services the Town Hall and Town Hall extension and has controlled access.

The Town Hall is Manchester's most significant civic landmark and an icon of its history. It opened in 1877 and is a masterpiece of Victorian Neo-Gothic architect, Alfred Waterhouse and was Grade I listed in 1952. Its external elevations are constructed of Sandstone ashlar, the rooves are covered by slate and it is between 5 and 8 storeys high. The building has been well maintained over the years, but many aspects are showing their age. Recent studies show that elements are reaching their natural lifespan.

It is triangular in shape with main public entrances on Albert Square and Cooper Street, with further entrances on Princess Street, and Lloyd Street. Corridors run around the building on the courtyard side. It has a richly designed triangular courtyard, beautiful nodal stairs and central stairs with exceptional craftsmanship and high architectural quality. Ceremonial and key public areas, include the principal entrance on Albert Square, the Sculpture Hall, the Great Hall and the state rooms which form the central part and stretch of rooms along Albert Square.

With the exception of these areas, the majority of the rooms in the Town Hall relate to the civic functions and include offices, meeting rooms and other functional spaces. The notable exception to this is the former police station (located beneath the Great Hall) and cells below it.

The services were distributed underfloor in the principal rooms and within decorative grate-covered routes running in the courtyard facing corridors. Large heating coils at the base of the stairs, allowed warm air to be distributed upward. Carefully designed head and ventilation routes behind the murals with the Great Hall benefit the fabric of the murals and prevent harmful condensation to its large decorative windows.

Waterhouse's original design is largely intact, having undergone relatively little alteration compared to similar buildings. Numerous cumulative alterations have taken place as a result of its ongoing civic use. These have affected the historic services and office spaces to the largest degree and have included harmful alteration including the 1950s and 1960s extensions to the courtyard link bridge to provide kitchens and catering facilities to serve events and functions within the Great Hall.

Paul Waterhouse (Alfred's son) designed the first notable changes to the building, including alterations associated with Victorian WC provision. In the late 19th and early 20th centuries the building was electrified and lifts were introduced.

The expansion of Manchester and associated growth of civic administration led to the construction of the Town Hall Extension during 1934-1938, which was designed by Emmanuel Vincent Harris, who also designed Central Library. The Town Hall Extension included alterations to the Town Hall through the introduction of link bridges over Lloyd Street. The Town Hall Extension and Central Library were extensively refurbished between 2010 and 2014.

In the late 1950s and 1960s, the central link bridge within the courtyard was extended and converted to kitchens and catering facilities.

The highest significance areas of the Town Hall, comprise all nodal/circular stairs, the Albert Square, Princess Street, Lloyd Street and Cooper Street entrance areas, the Sculpture Gallery, the principal circulation space, the ceremonial circulation space and stairs, the Great Hall, the 'Bees' landing, the Banqueting Room, the first floor reception room, the Tower Room, the Ante Room, the Conference Hall, the link bridges to the Great Hall, the organ area and associated retiring room, the Lord Mayor's Parlour, banqueting/reception areas and reception hall.

The functions of the Town Hall include offices and meeting rooms, state rooms, public meeting rooms, spaces for civic events including weddings, recitals and performances, registrar's office,

Coroner's Court, catering, retail, staff welfare facilities, WC provision, plant and circulation space. It has a Stop Equipment Room for the St Peters Square Metrolink Stop.

It is also a visitor attraction and hosts Civic Receptions, public and private meetings, conferences, weddings and receptions, banquets, dinner dances, drink receptions, exhibitions, performances, graduation ceremonies, film shows, Tea Dances and Organ Concerts. Many take place in the Great Hall. The Lord Mayor's Apartment, the State Rooms, the Reception Rooms, the Banqueting Room, the Conference Hall, the Registrar's Ceremony Room and function spaces are also used.

The building has been closed since 2018 and removable historic artefacts and special collections have been temporarily relocated where possible. Several applications have also been approved during 2018 and 2019 to allow investigation works to inform the refurbishment to allow all works to be developed from a detailed understanding of the heritage significance of the building and to be implemented following a robust methodology.

The main entrance is located on Albert Square. The listed structures in The Square comprising the Grade I Listed Albert Memorial and the Grade II Listed Jubilee Fountain and the Fraser', Bright, Heywood and Gladstone Statues. The Albert Memorial was also designed by Alfred Waterhouse and is an elaborate 73 foot tall Gothic enclosure with a marble statue within the centre. The condition of the Memorial has deteriorated and is in need of attention.

This application relates to a low significance area of the basement of the building and a basement level window opening and a basement level blocked up window and the moat of the building. All other works would be below ground in Albert Square and on Princess Street.

Description of development

Planning permission is sought for works to connect the Grade I Listed Manchester Town Hall into the Manchester Civic Quarter Heat Network (MCQHN) with heating and high voltage power connections. All the Proposed Works would be confined to the basement level of the listed building. This includes the following work:

- New Heating pipework and a communications duct to be extended from the existing buried heating mains within Albert Square, through the external moat wall and through an existing window at basement level, to the existing plate heat exchanger plantroom.
- High voltage and communication cabling to be installed to serve new Ring Main Units (RMU). The works for the HV cabling would be undertaken from the existing ducting within Princess Street and would be extended from the footpath, through a former window opening (currently infilled with modern blockwork), into the existing RMU room.

Land Interest

The City Council's land interest in the site relating to buildings and highway land has been disregarded in making this decision.

Consultations & Notification Responses

Publicity - The application was advertised in the local press as affecting the listed building. A site notice was displayed on site and letters were sent to surrounding occupiers - No comments have been received.

Highway Services - Confirmed that the proposals are acceptable

Environmental Health - Confirmed that no conditions are required on the basis that all pumps and mechanical plant associated with the heat network are all contained within the energy centre and are already subject to conditions on the main application.

Greater Manchester Police - Confirmed that they have no comments

Historic England (North West) - Advised that on the basis of the information available to date, they do not wish to offer any comments and suggest that we seek the views of our specialist conservation and archaeological advisers, as relevant.

Transport For Greater Manchester - Advised that they have no objection to this application and that the development proposals are unlikely to affect Metrolink operations, however as the site does adjoin the Highway in which Metrolink is situated they advise that the details of working safely near Metrolink can be found on the Metrolink Website at;
<https://www.tfgm.com/public-transport/tram/working-safely>

Greater Manchester Archaeological Advisory Service - Have confirmed that they consider that there are no archaeological implications for these minor works.

United Utilities Water PLC - No comments received

National Amenity Societies - No comments received

Greater Manchester Ecology Unit - Advised that there are unlikely to be any ecological constraints associated with this development and therefore no further information or measures are required.

Greater Manchester Pedestrians Society - No comments received

Issues

The main issues for consideration relate to the impact of the alterations on the amenity of surrounding occupiers and the impact on the setting of surrounding listed buildings and the surrounding conservation area and the impact on the character and appearance of the building. The main policies that relate to the proposal are SP1 (Spatial Principles), Policy CC1 (Primary Economic Development Focus (City Centre and Fringe), Policy CC9 (Design and Heritage) , Policy T1 (Sustainable Transport), Policy EN1 (Design Principles and Strategic Character Areas) , Policy EN3 (Heritage), EN4 (Reducing CO2 Emissions by Enabling Low and Zero Carbon Development), EN5, EN6 (Target Framework for CO2 reductions from low or zero carbon energy supplies), EN7, EN8 (Adaption to Climate Change), Policy EN14 (Flood Risk) , Policy EN16 (Air Quality), Policy EN17 (Water Quality) , Policy EN18 (Contamination), Policy EN19 and Policy DM1 of the Core Strategy for the City of Manchester, saved UDP policies DC 18.1, DC19.1, DC20 and Sections 6 (Building a Strong and Competitive Economy), 7 (Ensuring the Vitality of Town Centres), 8 (Promoting healthy and safe communities), Section 12 (Achieving Well-Designed Places), 14 (Meeting the challenge of climate change, flooding and coastal change),15 (Conserving and enhancing the natural environment), 16 (Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment) of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Design Issues, Relationship to Context and Impact on Historic Context

The location that both the pipework and high voltage cabling would enter the listed building and the method of entry and the internal location of the equipment has been considered and informed by an understanding of the significance of the listed building.

The proposals would also help to ensure a future for the building through the supply of low cost sustainable energy.

It is considered that the benefits of the proposal would outweigh the less than substantial harm caused to the affected heritage assets, and are consistent with paragraph 196 and 197 of the NPPF and address sections 66 and 72 of the Planning Act in relation to preservation and enhancement. The benefits of the proposals are very clear and include the benefits of costs of heating and powering the building and to the environment by using sustainable energy. The works would also as said above help to ensure a future for the building.

Given this, it is considered that the proposals are therefore in accordance with and would be in accordance with policies SO6, CC9, EN1, EN2, EN3, SP1 and DM1 of the Core Strategy for the City of Manchester and saved policies DC18.1 and DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester and Sections 12 and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Relationship to Transport Infrastructure

The advice provided by Transport for Greater Manchester would be applied to the application as an informative.

In view of the above, it is considered that the proposals are considered to be in accordance with policies SO1, SO5, SP1, DM1, CC5, CC10, T1 and EN16 of the Core Strategy for the City of Manchester.

Sustainability

The reason for and the purpose of this development is to provide sustainable energy to the Town Hall. The need to reduce the emission of carbon dioxide to the atmosphere is a long-standing international, national, sub-regional and local priority aim. The emission of carbon dioxide is scientifically acknowledged to be a major contributor to climate change and has known negative effects on the environment.

At national level the objective is to reduce emissions by 57% on 1990 levels by 2030. At the sub-regional level the emerging Greater Manchester Spatial Framework sets a target reduction of by 60% by 2035 compared to 1990 levels. At local level, the Manchester Climate Change Action Plan sets the target of reducing emissions by 41% by 2020 and the Manchester Climate Change Strategy establishes the target of Manchester being a zero carbon city by 2050.

The construction and operation of the Manchester Civic Quarter Energy Centre and Heat Network is specifically recognised as being critical to the City's carbon reduction objectives in a suite of strategy documents and plans as detailed above. The proposal would reduce the emission of carbon dioxide by 1,584 tonnes in the first year of operation and 12,362 tonnes during the first 15 years of operation. As a result of this supply to the Town Hall the reductions of carbon dioxide would be increased.

Given the above, the proposed development is entirely consistent with Core Strategy Policies EN4, EN5, EN6 and EN7.

Archaeological issues

Greater Manchester Archaeological Advisory Service has advised that there are no archaeological implications for these minor works

In view of the above and subject to compliance with conditions the proposals would be consistent with Policy DC20 contained in the UDP and policy CC9 of the Core Strategy and Section 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations

This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have a right to a fair hearing and to this end the local planning authority must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Core Strategy and saved policies of the Unitary Development Plan, the Director of Planning, Building Control & Licensing has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. She believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the recommendation given is proportionate to the wider benefits of and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Recommendation: Approve

Article 35 Declaration

In assessing the merits of an application officers will seek to work with the applicant in a positive and proactive manner to seeking solutions to problems arising in relation to dealing with the application. In the instance of the following applications this has included ongoing advice about the information required to be submitted to support the application and discussion of amendments to the proposals.

Condition(s) to be attached to decision for approval OR Reasons for recommendation to refuse

1) The development must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this permission.

Reason - Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following drawings and documents:

The site notice referenced 50467-VE-TH-00-SI-M-XX01 Rev P1 received by the City Council as local planning authority on 27 April 2020

The drawings referenced:

50467-VE-TH-B1-DR-M-5604 Rev P1

50467-VE-TH-B1-DR-M-5605 Rev P1

50467-VE-TH-B1-DR-M-5606 Rev P1 (proposed only)

all received by the City Council as local planning authority on 27 April 2020

The Heritage Statement prepared by Turley Heritage and received by the City Council as local planning authority on 27 April 2020

The Design and Access Statement prepared by Vital Energi and received by the City Council as local planning authority on 27 April 2020

The email from Rob Greenwood of Vital Energi dated 17 June 2020

The letter from Robert Greenwood of Vital Energi dated 16 June 2020

The letter from Jack Haw of Turley dated 24 April 2020

Reason - To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans. Pursuant to policies CC1, CC4, CC5, CC8, CC9, CC10, T1, EN1, EN2, EN3, EN4, EN5, EN6, EN7, EN14, EN15, EN16, EN17, EN18, EN19 and DM1 of the Core Strategy and saved policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan.

3) The areas of footpath, carriage way and all other land affected by the works shall be fully repaired and reinstated to match the existing surface treatment and shall be implemented in full within two months, or as otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority, of the completion of the works.

Reason - In the interests of amenity and to ensure that paving materials are consistent with the use of these areas as pedestrian routes and in accordance with policies EN1, T1, CC10, EN1, EN3, CC9, DM1 and SP1; of the Core Strategy and saved policies DC18.1 and DC19.1; of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

4) In the event that the alterations hereby approved are no longer required they shall be removed from the building and the land only in accordance with a method statement submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority prior to the removal of the works hereby approved. The removal shall be carried out only in accordance with the approved method statement and shall be completed within three months of the date of removal of the works hereby approved.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building in accordance with policies DM1, SP1, CC9 and EN3 of the Core Strategy for the City of Manchester and saved policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

Informatives

1) The applicant is advised that the details of working safely near Metrolink can be found on the Metrolink Website at; <https://www.tfgm.com/public-transport/tram/working-safely>

Appendix 1 – List of consultees & neighbours notified

Highway Services
Environmental Health
Greater Manchester Police
Historic England (North West)
Transport For Greater Manchester
Greater Manchester Archaeological Advisory Service
United Utilities Water PLC
National Amenity Societies
Greater Manchester Ecology Unit
Greater Manchester Pedestrians Society

Ground Floor, 31 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Third Floor, 31 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Second Floor, 31 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
37 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4FN
Basement, 31 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
57 - 63 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EG
Sixth Floor, 55 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Fifth Floor, 55 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Fourth Floor, 55 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Third Floor, 55 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Second Floor, 55 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
First Floor, 55 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Ground Floor, 55 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
City Council Engineers And Surveyors, Albert Square, Manchester, M2 5HD
63 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EQ
Basement And Ground Floor, 33 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Basement And Ground Floor, 65 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EG
THOMPSONS SOLICITORS LLP, First Floor To Fifth Floor, Pearl Assurance House, 23
Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4ER
DLA ARCHITECTS LTD, Sixth Floor, Pearl Assurance House, 23 Princess Street, Manchester,
M2 4EB
First Floor, 57 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EQ
Second Floor, 57 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EQ
Fourth Floor, 57 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EQ
65 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EG
First Floor, 31 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
Third Floor, 57 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EQ
Pearl Assurance House, 23 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EN
57 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EQ
55 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EW
39 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4FN
25 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4HH
Basement And Ground Floor, 25 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4HH
33 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4FN
23A Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EN
The Waterhouse, 67 - 71 Princess Street, Manchester, M2 4EG
24 Crosslee Road, Manchester, M9 6HG
22 Crosslee Road, Manchester, M9 6HG
20 Crosslee Road, Manchester, M9 6HG
122 Victoria Avenue East, Manchester, M9 6HF
124 Victoria Avenue East, Manchester, M9 6HF

Appendix 2 – Planning constraints

Article 4 Direction - Removal Of PD Rights Change Of Use From Class C3 To Class C4

Article 4 Direction - City Centre PD Restriction - Class B1(a) To C3

Aircraft Safeguarding Zone - Aircraft Safeguarding Zone - All Exceeding 90M

Coal Authority - Development Low Risk - Name: DEVELOPMENT_LOW_RISK_AREA

Conservation Area - Albert Square Conservation Area 1972

Susceptible to Surf Water Flood (Less) -

Susceptible to Surf Water Flood (Less) -

Susceptible to Surf Water Flood (Middle) -

Area Team Boundary - Name: CITY1