

Planning

Growth & Development

Delegated officer report for planning application

Application no. 132001/FH/2021

Date registered valid: 8 December 2021

Proposal: Erection of single storey rear canopy extension, installation of front porch canopies, together with the installation of replacement window sills to front elevation, replacement windows, elevational alterations to the rear and re-rendering of all elevation with associated landscaping works, and installation of an automated gate with brick gate post piers to the driveway

Address: 19 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD

Ward(s): Didsbury West Ward

Applicant: Mr Chris Ainsworth, 19 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD

Agent (if any): Mr Adam Hegab, Creative Architecture Ltd, 1 The Long Stables, Rochdale Road, Oldham, OL3 5UE

Case officer: Linda Marciniak
Tel: 0161 234 4636
Email: linda.marciniak@manchester.gov.uk

Recommendation: Approve

Date of recommendation: 3 February 2022



Application details

Type of application: Full Householder Application
Development type: Householder
Date of site visit: 13 January 2022
Standard consultations: Printed: 14 December 2021 Expired: 4 January 2022
Neighbour notifications Printed: 14 December 2021 Expired: 4 January 2022
Site notice Posted: 13 January 2022 Expired: 3 February 2022
Press advert Published: 21 December 2021 Expired: 11 January 2022
Departure from Development Plan: No
Environmental Statement: Not required
Listed building: Not applicable
Conservation area: Blackburn Park Conservation Area 1979
Tree Preservation Order: Not applicable

Description of site/building

The application site is an early C20 detached dwelling house situated on the north-western side of Elm Road in the Blackburn Park Conservation Area. It is set within a rectangular garden plot of 890m² mostly bounded at the front by hedging. The garden originally extended further south to include the land up to the boundary with the block of flats at Parkfield Court on the corner of Parkfield Road South. A parcel of the garden land was sold, and a new house constructed under the 2018 approval noted below.

The application site house is largely based on Arts and Crafts principles but has been variously extended and altered which has diluted this primary characteristic.

The building has an irregular plan form that is staggered and formed of a cross-gable at the front and 2no. gable extensions at the rear.

There is a distinctive but unsympathetic Neoclassical style front porch supported on ionic columns at the entrance together with exposed brick quoins and pronounced roughcast render to all elevations. The roof is covered in characteristic rosemary tiles and bears a very tall chimney in the roof valley above the porch. There is a secondary entrance to the right of the main front entrance.

Windows are timber-framed in a multi-pane arrangement with deteriorating timber sills.

The front garden is entirely paved with 'crazy paving' and there are no gates to secure access.

There is a tree on the adjacent site at no.21 Elm Road close to a small section of hedge on the application site. This tree has previously had its crown removed.

Planning History

074930/FH/2005/S2 - Erection of single storey rear extension to form additional living accommodation and covered porch area

088880/FH/2009/S2 - Erection of two storey rear extension including installation of a canopy, elevational alterations to side and rear and creation of basement to form recreation area under part of garden and house with decking above.

121390/FO/2018 - Erection of a three-storey dwelling house with basement and associated landscaping and car parking

Description of area

The site is within a mature residential area mainly characterised by detached and semi-detached individually designed houses within an Arts and Crafts theme with both traditional and contemporary infill new builds.

Boundaries are mainly a combination of hedging and red brick walls, the brick reflecting the most common building material, often combined with render and decorative timber framing gable details on front elevations.



19 Elm Road - 1974

Description of development

Erection of single storey rear canopy extension, installation of front porch canopies, together with the installation of replacement window sills to front elevation, replacement windows, elevational alterations to the rear and re-rendering of all elevation with associated landscaping works, and installation of an automated gate with brick gate post piers to the driveway.

The application is accompanied by a Heritage Assessment which describes the significance of the heritage asset and impact of the proposal on the property.

Consultations & Notification Responses

A total of 67no. neighbours were notified of the application as well as public display of a site notice. No comments were received.

Blackburn Park Conservation Society – No comments received.

City Arborist – No comments received.

Policy

The framework for assessing development in relation to heritage assets is set out in the following national and local policies and statute:

Section 72 (1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires local planning authorities to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character of a conservation area.

The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (2021) – Chapter 16 Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment. The Framework gives emphasis to a presumption in favour of sustainable development which means approving development, without delay, where it accords with the policies of the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

The proposed development is considered to accord with Chapter 16 of which the following sections apply:

194. Local planning authorities should require an applicant to identify and assess the significance of any heritage asset that may be affected by a proposal, including any contribution made by their setting, taking account of the available evidence and any necessary expertise. They should take this into account when considering the impact of a proposal on a heritage asset, to avoid or minimise any conflict between the heritage asset's conservation and any aspect of the proposal.

The Manchester Core Strategy Development Plan Document 2012-2027 ("the Core Strategy") was adopted by the City Council on 11th July 2012. The following policies are material to this application:

- o Policy DM1 - Development Management
- o Policy SP1 - Spatial Principles
- o Policy EN3 – Heritage
- o Policy EN9 – Green Infrastructure
- o Policy EN15 – Biodiversity and Geological Conservation

Unitary Development Plan (UDP) - The UDP has been superseded by the Core Strategy Development Plan. Several policies have been saved by way of a Secretary of State Saving Direction. For the purposes of this application, policies DC1 'Residential Extensions' and DC18.1 'Conservation Areas' are extant and therefore material to the assessment of the application.

For reasons to be outlined below, it is considered the proposal accords with the principles of the Development Plan.

Principle

Policies SP1, DM1 and EN3 of the Manchester Core Strategy 2012 (Core Strategy) seek to ensure that new development enhances or creates character, protects and enhances the built environment; and that the design, scale and appearance of the proposed development is appropriate to its context.

Policies DC1.1, DC1.2 and DC1.3 of the UDP relate specifically to residential extensions and set out criteria against which proposals for extensions will be assessed, whilst saved policy DC18.1 requires that development preserves and enhances the character of Conservation Areas. The mature green landscape character and the wildlife it supports is further protected by policies EN9 and EN15.

The proposal represents a scale of development that is acceptable in principle, subject to satisfactory compliance with policies that protect residential and visual amenity including the character of the Conservation Area.

Issues

Chapter 16, paragraph 197 of the NPPF (2021) requires that in determining applications, local planning authorities should take account of:

- (a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;
- (b) the positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and
- (c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.

Paragraph 194 requires applicants to identify and assess the significance of heritage assets which should be used as the basis for proposals affecting their conservation. The Conservation Area is the heritage asset and its significance has been identified as described in paragraph 6.4 of the submitted Heritage Assessment:

The significance of Blackburn Park Conservation Area derives from its character and appearance as an affluent residential suburb developed from the mid-19th to the early 20th century on land originally belonging to Charles Blackburn. It is characterised by detached and semi-detached Victorian and Edwardian houses set in large mature gardens along trees-lined roads, mostly built of brick but with occasional render or timber-framed decoration. The significance of the conservation area is therefore embodied primarily in these houses and their relationship to each other amid the street scene. Modern infill and redevelopment has however a notable presence, and hence has become embedded in the character of the conservation area.

The Council's identification of significance is set out in its description of the designated land:

Significance of the Conservation Area

- Building materials and styles are very varied. Older houses generally have textured light red or buff brick walls with blue slate roofs, and sometimes brick or stone dressings in contrasting colours. The later houses are predominantly smooth red brick, though render, half-timbering and decorative tile fringing are extensively used. Red tile and occasionally green slate are used for roofs and vertical cladding
- Windows are even more varied, some being subdivided by glazing bars, some leaded and a great many having Art Nouveau stained glass. Bay windows, bow windows and oriel windows are to be found in profusion
- Entrance doors are varied with combinations of fielded timber panels and stained-glass panels, and they always open on to a covered porch
- Chimney stacks are a notable feature of some of houses, being tall and decorated with projecting strings and corbelled brickwork
- Walls are mainly of brick with moulded terracotta copings, and occasionally the wall is divided into fielded panels with a plinth below and corbelled brickwork above. Sometimes brickwork is bonded in a darker red or in other colours
- Gardens at both front and rear of houses are large by most standards, and their boundaries to public highways are marked by walls, some of stone, and/or privet hedges. Few garden gates

remain intact, but those that do are typically of timber and as carefully detailed as the houses to which they belong, some of which have decorative gateposts.

Impact of the proposals

Porch canopy/secondary entrance canopy.

The present pastiche Neoclassical canopy detracts from the Arts and Crafts character of the original building. The proposal, a simple structure 1.5-metres deep x 3.0-metres wide comprising of a mono-pitch clay tile roof supported on 2no. timber posts which emerge from white rendered dwarf walls, is entirely in accordance with this character, being a typical form of original porches seen in properties elsewhere in the street scene. As such, it will enhance the building and its contribution to the Conservation Area. The secondary canopy over the door to the right of the main entrance is similarly appropriate comprising solely of an unsupported clay tile mono pitch roof.

Re-rendering.

All elevations are to be re-rendered. The roughcast that covers the elevations at present is not sympathetic and hence the appearance of the building will be improved by re-rendering in a smooth white finish. This will extend to cover the prominent exposed brick quoins which are historically inaccurate in this house type and which dominate the front elevation. The opportunity to simplify the front elevation through this treatment is welcomed.

Windows

Existing rotten timber windows and windowsills on the front elevation will be replaced like for like with the exception of the sills which will be replaced with a light buff sandstone on the front elevation. This is an acceptable alternative which has some precedent in the street scene, eg: at No.27 further north.

These works will enhance the appearance and contribution of the building to the appearance of the street scene, thus enhancing the Conservation Area.

Rear Elevation

Alterations to the rear elevation provide a new single storey canopy extension. This comprises of an 866mm deep structure that wraps around the rear and part of the side elevation. It has a height of 2.8-metres to a flat roof with elevations comprised of an anthracite grey (RAL7016) aluminium frame with extensive bi-fold glazed doors and infill timber cladding. There are no concerns with this element of the proposal which is clearly distinguished from the original dwelling by its contemporary design language and materials.

As the rear is enclosed and entirely private, there will be no impact upon the public views which establish the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

To the left of the canopy, an existing door leading into a ground floor utility room is proposed to be replaced with an obscurely glazed window in connection with the re-use of this space as a bathroom. A condition for this window and others where new bathrooms are proposed, to be obscurely glazed is appended in the interests of the privacy of the occupiers.

Driveway/installation of automated gate with brick posts.

The present open driveway is at odds with the street scene, which is characterised by enclosed front gardens. The proposal is to introduce a 1.4-metre high sliding timber automated vehicular gate which opens behind the existing hedge, and a separate 1.4-metre high timber pedestrian gate alongside. These will be affixed to new brick gate post piers and connecting walls comprising of 1.4-metre high Cheshire brick gate posts.

Together, the proposals reinstate the physically defined boundary which would originally have existed and therefore enhances the appearance and character of the Conservation Area as well as securing the site. The boundary treatment has precedence in the street scene with similar arrangements found at nos.13, 17 and 21.

The proposed surface treatment of most of the paved front garden area replaces the existing 'crazy paving' with bonded resin. This provides a clean and neat finish to the upgraded appearance of the dwelling with no loss of the 2-3no. spaces available to park off road.

Trees / Hedges

The 15-metre long privet and holly hedge (H2) forming the front boundary to the highway will be retained in situ. It is required to be protected during works to install the gates as set out in the submitted Tree Survey. A condition is therefore appended at the end of this report.

A 6-metre topped Lime tree (T1) and privet hedge (H1) on the party boundary with No.21 Elm Road to the north has been assessed as suitable for cutting back to the boundary. No protection measures are recommended.



Other protections are required for an apple tree (T7) and a group (G2) comprising a Cypress tree and crab apple, all in the rear garden although these are unlikely to be affected by the proposal.

Lastly, the Tree Survey has identified one tree T8 (an Elder) in the rear for removal. This is to facilitate erection of the rear single storey canopy. The tree has a U classification which indicates a low- quality specimen. As it is at the rear of the site, its removal will have little impact on the appearance of the dwelling and wider Conservation Area.

Conclusion

The proposals are considered to preserve and enhance the significance of the Conservation Area by reversing unsympathetic additions to the property and installing more authentic features. This raises the legibility of the dwelling as an historic building and thus forms a more acceptable and coherent relationship with the other historic and new buildings in this section of Elm Road.

This is considered to have wider public benefits for understanding the Conservation Area and thus complies with national and local planning policies for the management of heritage assets as set out in the Development Plan.

On the basis of the above, the proposal is considered to have acceptable impacts on visual amenity, the character of the Conservation Area, trees, as well as parking in accordance with saved UDP policies DC1 and DC18.1, Core Strategy policies DM1, EN3, EN9, EN15 and SP1 and the general principles within Chapter 16 of the NPPF.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations

This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have a right to a fair hearing and to this end the local planning authority must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Core Strategy and saved policies of the Unitary Development Plan, the Director of Planning, Building Control & Licensing has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. She believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the recommendation given is proportionate to the wider benefits of and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Recommendation: Approve

Article 35 Declaration

The local planning authority in making its decision has had due regard to paragraph 47 of the National Planning Policy Framework as well as the development plan, national planning policy and other material considerations and has approved the application subject to appropriate conditions and for the reasons outlined in the delegated report. The application received no comments on public notification and display of a site notice and has been determined with appropriate conditions as set out below, in the interests of residential and visual amenity.

Condition(s) to be attached to decision for approval OR Reasons for recommendation to refuse

1) The development must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this permission.

Reason - Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following drawings and documents received on the 21st of October 2021 or as stated:

Application form

Location Plan Ref: 1000

Existing Site Plan Ref: 1002

Existing Floor Plans Ref: 1004

Existing Elevations Ref:1005

Proposed Site Plan Ref: 1008 Rev C received on the 3rd of February 2022

Proposed Floor Plans Ref: 1009

Proposed Elevations Ref:1010

Proposed Gates, Piers and Garden Store and Bin Store Ref: 1011 Rev A received on the 3rd of February 2022

Topographical Survey Ref: 1001

Heritage Assessment prepared by Garry Miller Heritage Consultancy, dated December 2021, received on the 8th of December 2021

Arboricultural Statement prepared by Cheshire Woodlands (Glyn Thomas; Ref: CW/10662-AS, dated 24 November 2021) received on the 26th of November 2021

2 x Photos received on the 26th of November 2021

Reason - To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans, pursuant to policies SP1 and DM1 of the Core Strategy.

3) The materials to be used on external elevations shall be implemented in accordance with the details as set out in the Householder Application Form, drawings and supporting documents specified in Condition 2 of this Decision Notice.

Reason: In order to ensure a satisfactory appearance in the interests of visual amenity in accordance with saved policies DC1 and DC18.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester, EN3, SP1 and DM1 of the Manchester Core Strategy and the requirements of the National Planning Policy Framework (Chapter 16).

4) The ground floor bathroom window on the rear elevation, the first floor en-suite window on the front elevation and the first floor en-suite window on the side elevation as shown on floorplan Ref:1009 Rev B, shall be obscurely glazed to a specification of no less than level 5 of the Pilkington Glass Scale or such other alternative equivalent and shall remain so in perpetuity.

Reason - To protect the amenity and living conditions of adjacent residential properties from overlooking or perceived overlooking and in accordance with policies SP1 and DM1 of the Core Strategy.

5) Any works to trees to implement the permission hereby granted, shall be carried out in accordance with the recommendations contained within the approved Arboricultural Statement prepared by Cheshire Woodlands (Glyn Thomas; Ref: CW/10662-AS, dated 24 November 2021) received on the 26th of November 2021. The protection measures shall be carried out only in accordance with approved details.

Reason – To avoid damage to the roots of trees protected under the Conservation Area status and to safeguard the root protection zones of retained trees on the site in the interests of residential and visual amenity pursuant to policies DC1, DM1, EN9 and EN15 of the Development Plan for Manchester.

6) In this condition "retained tree" means an existing tree, shrub or hedge which is to be as shown as retained on the approved plans and particulars; and paragraphs (a) and (b) below shall have effect until the expiration of 5 years from the date of the occupation of the building for its permitted use.

(a) No retained tree shall be cut down, uprooted or destroyed, nor shall any retained tree be topped or lopped other than in accordance with the approved plans and particulars, without the written approval of the local planning authority. Any topping or lopping approved shall be carried out in accordance with British Standard 5387 (Trees in relation to construction)

(b) If any retained tree is removed, uprooted or destroyed or dies, another tree shall be planted at the same place and that tree shall be of such size and species, and shall be planted at such time, as may be specified in writing by the local planning authority.

(c) The erection of fencing for the protection of any retained tree shall be undertaken in accordance with the approved plans and particulars before any equipment, machinery or materials are brought on to the site for the purposes of the development, and shall be maintained until all equipment, machinery and surplus materials have been removed from the site. Nothing shall be stored or placed in any area fenced in accordance with this condition and the ground levels within those areas shall not be altered, nor shall any excavation be made, without the written consent of the local planning authority.

Reason - In order avoid damage to trees/shrubs adjacent to and within the site which are of important amenity value to the area and in order to protect the character of the area, in accordance with policies EN9 and EN15 of the Core Strategy.

7) All tree work should be carried out by a competent contractor in accordance with British Standard BS 3998 "Recommendations for Tree Work".

Reason - In order avoid damage to trees/shrubs adjacent to and within the site which are of important amenity value to the area and in order to protect the character of the area, in accordance with policies EN9 and EN15 of the Core Strategy.

Appendix 1 – List of consultees & neighbours notified

Blackburn Park Conservation Society
Neighbourhood Team Leader (Arboriculture)

17 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD
5A Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
12A Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD
9 Trafalgar Place, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3TF
13 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DB
8 Trafalgar Place, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3TF
5 Trafalgar Place, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3TF
11 Trafalgar Place, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3TF
1 Stonecroft Court, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Northern Lawn Tennis And Squash Club, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3YA
7C Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Flat 2, Stonecroft, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
7B Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
The Coach House, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
1 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Fouray, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
12 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD
6 Trafalgar Place, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3TF
Flat 4, 5 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Flat 2, 5 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
21 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD
18 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD
24 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
18 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
12 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
25 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
19 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
13 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
7 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Flat 7, Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
Flat 3, Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
Flat 1, Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
10 Trafalgar Place, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3TF
12 Trafalgar Place, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3TF
7 Trafalgar Place, Palatine Road, Manchester, M20 3TF
10 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XB
Flat 3, Stonecroft Court, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Stonecroft, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
5 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Flat 3, 5 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
Flat 1, 5 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
4 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
3 Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
16 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD
14 Elm Road, Manchester, M20 6XD
28 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
26 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
22 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH

20 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
16 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
14 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
10 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
29 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
27 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
23 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
21 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
17 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
15 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
11 Blackburn Gardens, Manchester, M20 3YH
Flat 9, Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
Flat 8, Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
Flat 5, Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
Flat 4, Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
Flat 2, Parkfield Lodge, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DD
Flat 4, Stonecroft, Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA
7A Parkfield Road South, Manchester, M20 6DA

Appendix 2 – Planning constraints

Article 4 Direction - Removal Of PD Rights Change Of Use From Class C3 To Class C4
Aircraft Safeguarding Zone - Aircraft Safeguarding Zone - All Exceeding 90M
Conservation Area - Blackburn Park Conservation Area 1979
HS2 Phase 2b Safeguarding Zones - HS2 Safeguarding Zones (October 2020)
Area Team Boundary - Name: SOUTH